

MAR 29 1924

Anglican Theological Review



EDITED BY

SAMUEL A. B. MERCER, BURTON S. EASTON, FRANK H. HALLOCK
and FREDERICK C. GRANT

In Collaboration with Representative Scholars
throughout the Church

VOLUME VI

MARCH, 1924

NUMBER 4

CONTENTS

Church Organization According to Clement. <i>Lefferd M. A. Haughwout.</i>	273
Jewish and Early Christian Ordination II. <i>Burton Scott Easton.</i>	285
The Theological Literature of the Syriac Churches. <i>Frank H. Hallock.</i>	296
A New Testament Bibliography for 1918 to 1922 Inclusive. <i>Frederick C. Grant.</i>	309
Notes, Comments, and Problems.	320
Reviews	326
Books Received	363

PUBLISHED BY

Columbia University Press

LANCASTER, PA.

AND

NEW YORK, N. Y.

Anglican Theological Review

VOLUME VI

MARCH, 1924

NUMBER 4

ADVISERS

VERY REV. HUGHELL E. W. FOSBROKE, D.D., Dean of General Theological Seminary
RT. REV. WILLIAM T. MANNING, D.D., D.C.L., Bishop of New York

EDITORIAL BOARD

HONORARY COOPERATING EDITORS

REV. PROFESSOR LORING W. BATTEN, D.D., Ph.D., General Theological Seminary
REV. PROFESSOR F. E. BRIGHTMAN, D.D., University of Oxford
REV. CANON R. H. CHARLES, D.D., Westminster Abbey, London
RT. REV. ARTHUR C. HEADLAM, D.D., Bishop of Gloucester
VERY REV. W. R. INGE, D.D., St. Paul's Cathedral, London
REV. PROFESSOR F. J. FOAKES JACKSON, D.D., Union Theological Seminary
REV. PROFESSOR FRANCIS J. HALL, D.D., General Theological Seminary
REV. DARWELL STONE, D.D., Pusey House, Oxford
REV. CANON B. H. STREETER, M.A., University of Oxford
RT. REV. WILLIAM WALTER WEBB, D.D., Bishop of Milwaukee
REV. ELWOOD WORCESTER, D.D., Ph.D., Emmanuel Church, Boston

DEPARTMENTAL EDITORS

REV. LESTER BRADNER, Ph.D., General Board of Religious Education (Religious Education)
MR. CHARLES L. DIBBLE, D.C.L., Kalamazoo, Mich. (Polity and Canon Law)
REV. CHARLES W. DOUGLAS, Mus.D., Peekskill, New York (Church Music)
REV. PROFESSOR BURTON S. EASTON, D.D., Ph.D., General Theological Seminary (New Testament)
REV. PROFESSOR FRANK GAVIN, Th.D., General Theological Seminary. (Church History)
REV. PROFESSOR FRANK H. HALLOCK, D.D., Seabury Divinity School (Patristics)
REV. WILLIAM LOCKTON, M.A., B.D., Diocesan Training College, Winchester (Liturgics)
VERY REV. PROFESSOR SAMUEL A. B. MERCER, D.D., Ph.D., Trinity College, Toronto (Old Testament)
REV. E. G. SELWYN, M.A., Editor of *Theology*, Havant, England (Dogmatic Theology)
REV. GEORGE CRAIG STEWART, D.D., L.H.D., St. Luke's, Evanston, Ill. (Homiletics)
PROFESSOR ROBERT M. WENLEY, Sc.D., D.C.L., L.L.D., University of Michigan (Apologetics)

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

REV. PROFESSOR HOWARD C. ACKERMAN, M.A., B.D., Nashotah House (Old Testament)
REV. PROFESSOR A. HAIRE FORSTER, M.A., B.D., Western Theological Seminary (New Testament Greek)
REV. PROFESSOR THEODORE B. FOSTER, B.A., Western Theological Seminary (Dogmatics)
REV. PROFESSOR HERBERT H. GOWEN, D.D., University of Washington (Old Testament)
REV. FREDERICK C. GRANT, S.T.D., Trinity Church, Chicago (New Testament)
REV. JOHN A. MAYNARD, D.D., Ph.D., Pd.D., Bryn Mawr College (History of Religions)
REV. PROFESSOR PERCY V. NORWOOD, M.A., B.D., Western Theological Seminary (Church History)
PROFESSOR VIDA D. SCUDDER, M.A., Wellesley College (Ethics)
REV. CHARLES L. STREET, M.A., B.D., Chicago, Ill. (Sociology)
REV. PROFESSOR WALTER F. WHITMAN, B.A., B.D., Bexley Hall (Church History)

All editorial communications should be addressed to the editors at Trinity College, Toronto, Ontario, Canada.

The REVIEW is published four times a year, in May, October, December and March, by the Columbia University Press, a corporation. The officers of the Press are Nicholas Murray Butler, president; Wm. H. Carpenter, secretary. Subscription price, \$4.00 annually. Single numbers \$1.00. Subscriptions and all business communications should be addressed to the publishers, Columbia University Press, Prince and Lemon Streets, Lancaster, Pa., or Columbia University, New York, N. Y., U. S. A.

Entered as second-class matter, June 17, 1919, at the post office at Lancaster, Pa., under the act of March 3, 1879.

Copyright, 1924, by Columbia University Press

Anglican Theological Review

EDITED BY

SAMUEL A. B. MERCER

BURTON S. EASTON

FRANK H. HALLOCK

FREDERICK C. GRANT

In Collaboration with Representative Scholars
throughout the Church

VOLUME VI

MARCH, 1924

NUMBER 4

CHURCH ORGANIZATION ACCORDING TO CLEMENT

By LEFFERD M. A. HAUGHWOUT, San Juan, Porto Rico

What view of the organization of the early Church is revealed to us in Clement's epistle to the Corinthians? The advocates of the "presbyter-bishop" theory, which attributes the chief ministry to a college of presbyters who are also known as bishops, have regarded this work hitherto as a stronghold. In the *ANGLICAN THEOLOGICAL REVIEW* of May, 1920, however, the present writer ventured to assert that the epistle was susceptible to a different interpretation, and that it in no wise contravenes the "development theory" which he there propounded. According to this, the primitive presbyters were not concerned with the functions of liturgical ministry, but corresponded rather to the presbyters of the synagogue. The active ministry in each local Church was exercised by the bishop and his deacons; the *paroikia* of the bishop evolving gradually into a diocese, with the presbyters, *pari passu*, acquiring the liturgical functions which they did not possess in the beginning, and becoming heads of parishes. The key to this solution was found in the varying significance of the term "presbyter" in Jewish-Christian literature, and in the striking testimony of the Syrian *Didascalia*.

It is the purpose of the present article to substantiate this claim, if possible, by an examination of the relevant passages in Clement's epistle. Before proceeding to this examination, how-

ever, it is advisable to review briefly the several uses of the term "presbyter" to which reference has been made, for it occurs frequently in the epistle, and the whole problem turns upon its correct interpretation.

In any discussion of the primitive presbyterate, whether Jewish or Christian, it is of first importance to observe the variable use of the term *presbyteroi*. It is used, first of all, and perhaps most frequently, to describe the older persons as contrasted with the young. ("Rebuke not an elder (*πρεσβυτέρῳ μὴ επιπλήξης*), but exhort him as a father; the younger men as brethren; the elder women as mothers; the younger sisters, in all purity." 1 Tim. 5: 1-2.) It is used technically of the council of presbyters in a local church or synagogue. ("Neglect not the gift that is in thee, which was given thee by prophecy, with the laying on of the hands of the presbytery." 1 Tim. 4: 14.) Again, it is used in a broad generic sense to describe the leaders or other leading men of the community, including those who are officials and those who are not. The officials themselves are so designated, as a class, without distinction of rank. And finally, it may refer to the "fathers" who have passed away. ("For therein the elders had witness borne to them." Heb. 11: 2.)

In commenting upon the Old Testament "elders" and "judges," Schürer writes: "Now seeing that the judges are expressly mentioned along with the elders (Deut. 21: 2, Ezra 10: 4), the two orders of officials are in any case to be regarded as distinct, but probably only to the extent that the judges were those among the elders to whom the administration of justice was specially entrusted." . . . So also with reference to the Sanhedrim, at a much later time: "Such other members as did not belong to one or other of the two classes just referred to (*ἀρχιερεῖς, γραμματεῖς*), were simply known as *πρεσβύτεροι*, under which general designation both priests and laymen might be included." (*Hist. of the Jewish People*, II, ii, 150.)¹

¹ "Steps in the Organization of the Early Church," *ANGLICAN THEOLOGICAL REVIEW*, III, i, p. 35. The present-day use of the term "clergy" is instructive in this connection. Ordinarily and correctly it includes bishops, presbyters, and deacons, but not uncommonly we see the expression, "the bishop and clergy."

It is clear, then, that when the term *presbyteros* was taken over by the Christian Church, it carried with it several shades of meaning, and that, apart from other evidence, it is sometimes difficult to distinguish between them. More often than not it refers to a class rather than to an office: to the leading men of the Christian community, or to the whole category of officials without distinction of particular offices.²

With the foregoing usages in mind, then, let us proceed to an examination of the crucial passages in St. Clement's epistle to the Church at Corinth. The first to invite attention is the following:

(1) For ye did all things without respect of persons, and walked in the commandments of God, being obedient to those who had the rule over you (*ἡγουμένοις*), and giving fitting honor to the presbyters among you. Ye enjoined young men to be of a sober and serious mind; ye instructed your wives to do all things with a blameless becoming. Cap. i.

(2) So the worthless rose up against the honored, those of no reputation against such as were renowned, the foolish against the wise, the young against the advanced in years (*πρεσβυτέρους*). For this reason righteousness and peace are now departed from you. Cap. iii.

(3) Let us reverence the Lord Jesus Christ, whose blood was given for us; let us esteem those who have the rule over us; let us honor the presbyters among us; let us train up the young men in the fear of God; let us direct our wives to that which is good. Cap. xxi.

Clement's classification of the Christian community is significant: *rulers, presbyters (elder-men), young men, wives*. The exhortations to obey and esteem those who exercise rule in the Church are clearly reminiscent of 1 Thess. 5: 12, "But we beseech you, brethren, to know them that labor among you, and are over you in the Lord, and admonish you," and of Heb. 13: 17, 24, "Obey them that have the rule over you, and submit to them, for they watch in behalf of your souls, as they that shall give account." "Salute all them that have the rule over you." That

² *Ibid.*

he means by these the clergy or liturgical leaders of the Church there can be little doubt, though we could wish that he had specified them by a less general designation.

The next in order are the presbyters. The term here does not refer primarily to officials, but to that inevitable oriental group of those who have attained mature age, the men of position and influence. They are contrasted both with the young men and the rulers. They are those who determine who the rulers, *i.e.*, the clergy, shall be, and who uphold them in the exercise of their ministry. It was against this group, as we shall see later, that the uprising in the Church was directed. The "council" of presbyters is included, to be sure, but the writer's purpose does not require that they be specially designated in this place. His main thought is the contrast between the entire body of elder men and the "young men." The later term, it must be noted, does not signify "youths," but those rather of military age, in accordance with the usual classification of Greek communities.

But we must not insist upon too much precision in the writer's terminology. He is not composing an act of Parliament, but writing a friendly letter, and there is no reason to suppose that his classifications are so hard and fast as to be either exhaustive or mutually exclusive. The "rulers" themselves no doubt were regarded as presbyters, either by virtue of inherent position or in recognition of their office (though not in the old Calvinistic sense of "ruling elders," as will appear later), and had Clement's purpose been different, he might have included them in this category. But he has a special reason for distinguishing the "rulers" from the other presbyters. His classification of the Christian community is not haphazard, but studied. He is preparing the way for a later argument. —Beginning with chapter xl, he undertakes to draw a parallel between the ministrations of the Church and the orderly appointments of the temple and priesthood under the elder dispensation. From this he passes to a justification of the Christian ministry, and asserts its apostolic origin and authority. Those whom he names are the

"bishops and deacons." That these are the "rulers" to whom he has already twice referred there is no room for doubt.

Cap. xlii. And thus preaching through countries and cities, they (the Apostles) appointed the first-fruits (of their labors), having first proved them by the Spirit, to be bishops and deacons of those who should afterwards believe. Nor was this any new thing, since indeed many ages before, it was written concerning bishops and deacons. For thus saith the Scriptures in a certain place, "I will appoint their bishops in righteousness, and their deacons in faith."

Clement's description of the ministry is quite as familiar to us as his preceding classification of the Christian community, for in naming "bishops and deacons" as the constituent orders, he but confirms the testimony of St. Paul, the *Didache*, the Syrian *Didascalia*, and the second book of the Constitutions of the Apostles. The Old Testament reference, whatever else it may imply, excludes the possibility of taking the term "bishops" untechnically. It is a patent effort to find prophetic basis for an established Christian office. The presbyters, officially considered, are not by any means to be omitted from the picture, but they have not yet acquired fixed liturgical or pastoral functions, nor taken their place among those who dedicate their whole time to ministry. The *κλήρος* has not yet marked them out and separated them from the congregation as a consecrated order.

So far there have been no more than veiled references to the cause of the sedition, as seen in the repeated emphasis upon the subjection due by the young to the older. We come now, however, to statements which make the situation reasonably clear, in spite of an apparent confusion of terms. It is important to have the crucial passages before us in their entirety.

Cap. xliv. Our apostles also knew, through our Lord Jesus Christ, that there would be strife on account of the office of the episcopate. For this reason, therefore, inasmuch as they had obtained a perfect foreknowledge of this, they appointed those (ministers) already men-

tioned, and afterwards gave instructions, that when these should fall asleep, other approved men should succeed them in their ministry (*λειτουργίαν*). We are of opinion, therefore, that those appointed by them, or afterwards by other eminent men, with the consent of the whole Church, and who have blamelessly served the flock of Christ in an humble, peaceable, and disinterested spirit, and have for a long time possessed the good opinion of all, cannot be justly dismissed from the ministry. For our sin will not be small if we eject from the episcopate those who have blamelessly and holily fulfilled its duties (*τους . . . προσευγκόντας τὰ δῶρα*—those who have . . . offered the sacrifices). Blessed are those presbyters who, having finished their course before now, have obtained a fruitful and perfect departure (from this world); for they have no fear lest any one deprive them of the place now appointed them. But we see that ye have removed some men of excellent behaviour from the ministry, which they fulfilled blamelessly and with honor.

Cap. xlvii. It is disgraceful, beloved, yea, highly disgraceful, and unworthy of your Christian profession, that such a thing should be heard of as that the most stedfast and ancient Church of the Corinthians should, on account of one or two persons, engage in sedition against its presbyters.

Cap. liv. Who then among you is noble-minded? who compassionate? who full of love? Let him declare, If on my account sedition and disagreement and schisms have arisen, I will depart, I will go away whithersoever ye desire, and I will do whatever the majority (multitude) commands; only let the flock of Christ live on terms of peace with the presbyters set over it.

Cap. lvii. Ye therefore who laid the foundation of this sedition, submit yourselves to the presbyters, and receive correction so as to repent, bending the knees of your hearts.

Chapter xlv indicates unmistakably that the dissension in the Corinthian Church was on account of the office of the episcopate, but as to precisely what phase or aspect of the office is under dispute we are not informed. After pointing out the sin

of ejecting from the ministry those who have been lawfully appointed, with the consent of the whole Church, and have blamelessly "offered the sacrifices," the writer pauses to exclaim: "Blessed are those *presbyters* who, having finished their course before now, have obtained a fruitful and perfect departure (from this world) etc." This sentence has led many to suppose that the author uses the terms "bishop" and "presbyter" interchangeably of the same office. But let us consider the facts. Heretofore he has discriminated with some care between the "rulers" of the Church and the presbyters, and we are led to suspect, therefore, that the term "presbyter" is used in this place in a special sense. And this, indeed, is apparent when we note to whom it is applied, viz., to those "who have obtained a fruitful and perfect departure." Apart from the fact that every bishop was an "elder" or "presbyter" in a broad generic sense, and might be so described without prejudice to his official position, those of whom the writer here speaks are "elders" from the standpoint of time, members of a past generation. Compare Heb. 11:2, "For therein the elders had witness borne to them," and Papias iv, "As the elders who saw John the disciple of the Lord remembered, etc." It is a safe rule to interpret *presbyteros* in this sense whenever it refers to one who is long dead, from the standpoint of the incident in question, unless the context expressly indicates otherwise.

So far, therefore, there is no real confusion of the two terms, nor any ground for inferring that "bishop" and "presbyter" refer to the same office. That which at first sight seemed to be an interchange of titles is seen to be nothing more than a well-known use of the term "presbyter," such as we find illustrated in the literature of the times with great frequency. We still have before us the classification, "rulers" (bishops and deacons), and presbyters; the latter embracing, no doubt, both the presbyters of age and position and those of special appointment, i.e., the members of the council.

The rulers are not mentioned again in the epistle, but in

chapter xlvii we learn that the sedition was directed against the "presbyters," and in chapter liv the instigators of it are urged to submit to the will of the majority (literally, "the multitude"), and to let the flock of Christ live on terms of peace with the presbyters set over it."

These passages are worthy of close study. It might appear, at first sight, that the author means bishops, and that here at least is evidence that the offices of bishop and presbyter were identical. And of course, apart from the implications of the context, the passages are open to this construction. But we are by no means shut up to this view of the situation, and those who accept it would seem to lose the whole point of Clement's carefully ordered argument. A truer explanation, and one which fits in with and explains the preceding passages as well, is involved in a correct understanding of the nature of the Corinthian sedition.

We already have noted the repeated emphasis upon the honor due to the presbyters (cap. i and xxi), and the assertion in cap. iii, that the sedition was characterized by the insurrection of the "worthless," "those of no reputation," "the foolish," "*the young*," against "the honoured," "the renowned," "the wise," "*the advanced in years*." If we read these passages in connection with those under discussion, something of the true nature of the sedition will dawn upon us. The office of the episcopate was the bone of contention, *but* the contending parties were a certain younger element of the Church, upon one hand, and the older members, led naturally by the council of presbyters, upon the other. It may be that the presbyters had chosen an occupant for the episcopal office who was unacceptable to the insurgents, or that some delicate question of discipline had risen, in which the decision of the bishop and presbyters was not recognized by them. As a result of the dissension, certain blameless ones were ejected from their ministry. In chapter iii there are plain intimations of violence.

If we are correct in these assumptions, Clement's argument

throughout the epistle will appear consistent and skilfully ordered, and his terminology in speaking of the organization of the Church carefully chosen. On the broad basis of the honor and submission which the younger owe to their elders (presbyters), let the movers of the sedition acknowledge such "rulers" (bishops and deacons) as they, the presbyters, have chosen—or whose discipline and ministry they have sustained. These same rulers, moreover, are the appointment of God, for the Apostles, having received order from Jesus Christ, ordained them for the ministry of the Church. The argument is two-fold: the natural right of the presbyters to direct the affairs of the congregation on account of age and honorable position, and the divine right of an episcopate, which derived its authority through an Apostle or "other eminent men," to continue unmolested in the exercise of its ministry. It is quite evident that the Corinthian episcopate was not the creation of presbytery or congregation, whatever may have been its relation to them in other respects.

It will appear, then, if these conclusions are valid, that Clement's epistle to the Corinthians cannot be relied upon to support the "presbyter-bishop" theory, as commonly expounded. In the very first chapter we are confronted with an obvious distinction between presbyters and rulers, *ἡγούμενοι*, and as the latter must be identified with the "bishops and deacons" of a later mention—an inference which can hardly be avoided—it follows of necessity that the terms "bishop" and "presbyter" connote different categories. The burden of proof, at any rate, is with those who maintain the contrary. There is, to be sure, a somewhat equivocal use of the term "presbyter" in chapters xlvii, liv, and lvii; but apart from the uncertainty which always attaches to this title, we find, upon closer study of the writer's argument, that the difficulty is imaginary.

It still remains, however, to discuss the question as to whether there was one bishop in the Corinthian Church, or more than one. The latter would appear more likely, upon the surface,

and if it were not for certain *a priori* arguments to the contrary, there would be no question to discuss. But so long as we are unable to identify any church of the apostolic or sub-apostolic periods in which the "co-bishops" are known by name, or find some clear, categorical statement of a contemporary writer that such polity existed, we may not assume that it existed in a specific case until the contrary possibilities have been eliminated. For it is a fact which admits no dispute that no such statement has been found, and in all cases without exception in which the rulers of local Churches have been identified—and there are many such—we find in every case one bishop to a Church, and only one. Appearances to the contrary, therefore, must be scrutinized with considerable care.

Having admitted, in the case of the present document, that the surface indications favor the existence of a plural episcopate in Corinth, we hasten to observe that the basis of this assumption, after all, is somewhat narrow, being limited to a single sentence, and that by no means amounting to a clear affirmation of fact.

The plural designation in cap. i, "those who had the rule over you," as also in cap. xxi, implies nothing one way or the other, as the deacons are in all probability included. (Cf. cap. xlii.) And even though they were not, the reference may be taken as a broad general statement covering successive rulers as well as contemporaries. The account of the original appointment of bishops and deacons in cap. xlii is obviously a statement of this kind, and refers, not to any particular Church, but to the Church at large. Clement, indeed, is particularly fond of posing his arguments in the form of general statements, with the conclusion so obvious that the reader may be left to draw the inevitable conclusion. This we have noted in a specific case.

Of such general character are the statements and expressions in the first part of cap. xlv: "they appointed those (ministers) already mentioned," "those appointed by them, or afterwards by other eminent men," "if we eject from the episcopate those who

have blamelessly and holily fulfilled its duties," and "Blessed are those presbyters," etc. Not until the last sentence of the chapter do we come to the specific application of the argument implied by these statements to the conditions existing in the Corinthian Church. "But we see that ye have removed some men of excellent behaviour from the ministry which they fulfilled blamelessly and with honor." It is this sentence which seems to imply a plural episcopate.

But let us examine the passage more carefully. As the writer has intimated that the sedition arose "on account of the office of the episcopate," we naturally infer that those ejected "from the ministry" were of that order. Yet, even so, it is possible that successive appointments were contested by the rebellious faction; in which case more than one bishop at a time is not demanded to satisfy the writer's statement. A more likely solution, however, turns upon the fact that it is not asserted that "some men" were ejected from the episcopate, but "from the ministry which they fulfilled, etc.," which is a more inclusive terminology. In other words, if a single bishop and his deacons were displaced from office, as would be not unlikely in such a case, the terms of the passage would be fulfilled.

Neither of the foregoing solutions, however, should be pressed further than to check the too confident claim that a plural episcopate is proven by this passage. In point of fact the passage is indecisive, and we must look elsewhere for *proof*, as regards the question of monepiscopate or plural episcopate. What St. Clement's epistle *does* prove is that there was a distinction between episcopate and presbytery, and that the former was due to Apostolic appointment.

Even should the fact of a plural episcopate for a given community be demonstrated by some future discovery, it is by no means likely that it would conform to the popular conception of a joint committee exercising coördinate authority over the same group of Christians. More probably it would be accounted for by an experimental plurality of congregations in the one city,

with a bishop over each; or as suggested in a former article,³ with regard to Philippi, the inclusion of suburban and near-by country Churches under the broad designation of the metropolitan Church. But so far, the plural episcopate exists only as a dubious inference from certain fragmentary references which seem, upon the surface, to lend themselves to the theory. A proven instance of it, or a contemporary statement of its existence, has yet to be discovered.

³ *ANGLICAN THEOLOGICAL REVIEW*, III, i, page 45, note.

JEWISH AND EARLY CHRISTIAN ORDINATION

II

By BURTON SCOTT EASTON, D.D., General Theological Seminary, New York

To recapitulate briefly the results reached in the first part of this study.¹ The only ordained religious officials who were certainly recognized in Judaism before A.D. 70 were the elders. These elders, in collegiate organization, were at the head of every Jewish community, great or small, in Palestine or out of it.² And the collegiate organizations were known as "sanhedrins, or in the Greek world as *γερονσῳλαι*. In non-Palestinian localities such bodies had a recognized president, the gerosiarch, but in the Holy Land there is no evidence for presiding officers except in Jerusalem, where the high priest was *ex officio* the head.

These sanhedrins administered all the affairs of their communities on the basis of the Law of God, as written in the Old Testament and interpreted (and expanded) in the later tradition. Consequently careful training in the tradition was essential before admission to the office, but the training in itself did not make a man an elder. Before any one could take his seat in a sanhedrin he was solemnly ordained by the imposition of the hands of those who were already members and had themselves been similarly ordained. This ordination, the *s'mika*, conferred "character," and was not repeated on promotion to a more important sanhedrin; once an elder, always an elder.

Now it is familiar that at one stage of the development of the apostolic church, that represented by the Pastoral Epistles and the Book of Acts,³ the government of local churches—or of

¹ Vol. V, pp. 308-319, 1923.

² Outside of Palestine, however, they were usually called "rulers" (*ἄρχοντες*), because "elder" in this sense was not good Greek.

³ A date that cannot be far either way from the year 85. The general post-Pauline character of the Pastorals is assumed in the following discussion.

many of them—by elders appears as the accredited form of Church polity. And in the Pastoral Epistles this government is explained in some detail.

The battle against heresy, presumably some incipient form of Gnosticism, had thrown the Church back on apostolic tradition as the chiefest weapon in the struggle. And this tradition was of course in part doctrinal, for the heretics were introducing unheard-of beliefs. But at this period of Christianity the doctrinal dispute lay somewhat in the background; as every commentator on the Pastorals points out, the phrase translated "sound doctrine" in the English versions should be rendered "wholesome teaching." For the Pastorals are not especially interested in purely theological matters, nor do they generally condemn merely theoretical errors very harshly.⁴ What the Pastorals are concerned about is conduct. That which is "contrary to the sound doctrine according to the gospel of the glory of the blessed God" (1 Tim. 1: 10-11) is the behavior of men who are "lawless, unruly, ungodly, sinners, murderers, fornicators, liars," etc. (verses 9-10). More concretely, the Pastorals have been aroused by the heretical ethical teaching, an asceticism apparently (not quite certainly) blended with libertinism, a teaching that was threatening to wreck Christian morals. In opposition to this is set the teaching (chiefly the ethical teaching) of the apostles (represented by St. Paul), which has been recalled everywhere and carried among wider circles by the lieutenants of the apostles (represented by Timothy and Titus).

But the general supervision of such lieutenants was not enough, for even if they were still supposed to be alive, they could not attend to all the details of the various churches everywhere. So in every community there must be accredited and permanently settled teachers, into whose hands the correct "tradition" is

⁴ Such things "minister questionings" (1 Tim. 1: 4), lead to "vain talking" (1 Tim. 1: 6), are "secular," the "foolish talk of old women" (1 Tim. 4: 7), "disputes about words" (1 Tim. 6: 4, 2 Tim. 2: 14), "babblings" (1 Tim. 6: 20, 2 Tim. 2: 16), "foolish and ignorant questionings that gender strifes" (2 Tim. 2: 23), "genealogies and fightings about the law that are unprofitable and vain" (Tit. 3: 9).

committed. And a main purpose of the Pastorals is to secure the appointment of such teachers. Representative for all three Epistles in this regard is 2 Tim. 2:2: "The things which thou hast heard from me among many witnesses, the same commit thou to faithful men, who shall be able to teach others also." In other words, the apostolic tradition is a closed thing, delivered by St. Paul to Timothy, by him in turn to be delivered to men who will pass it on unchanged to others.

These men are the "elders." Their fundamental function is to govern the community by maintaining and applying the correct rule of faith and life, "holding to the faithful word which is according to the teaching" (Tit. 1:9). Like the addressees of the Epistles they are to be "nourished in the words of the faith and of the wholesome teaching which (they) have followed until now" (1 Tim. 4:6), to "guard that which is committed" (1 Tim. 6:20), to "abide in the things which (they) have learned, knowing of whom (they) have learned them" (2 Tim. 3:14).⁵ And in turn this tradition is bound up intimately with the Old Testament Scriptures, which are "profitable for teaching, for reproof, for correction" (2 Tim. 3:16, cf. 1 Tim. 1:8-10).

Guided by such teaching these elders are to "rule" each church (1 Tim. 3:5, 5:17, etc.). They act as a collegiate body (Tit. 1:5, 1 Tim. 5:17, 2 Tim. 2:2). They are ordained by the imposition of hands (1 Tim. 5:22).⁶ They train their own successors (2 Tim. 2:2). And—taking 1 Tim. 4:14 by itself and at its face value⁷—they ordain them also. In other words, on the basis of the evidence thus far collected, the elders of the Pastoral Epistles and the Jewish elders are exactly the same thing.

⁵ This "teaching," however, is not yet quite credal. The passage 2 Tim. 1:13 which the English versions render "hold the pattern of sound words" means "take as an example of correct preaching"; there is no article before "pattern."

⁶ To take this passage as referring to the reconciliation of penitents is a sheer anachronism.

⁷ The relation of 1 Tim. 4:14 to 1 Tim. 5:22, 2 Tim. 1:6 will be discussed later.

As will be seen later the Christians acquired special duties belonging to the practice of the new religion, but at the start Christianity simply took over the Jewish polity unchanged, including the same method of ordination to perform the same duties.

Turning now to the state of affairs in Acts, similar phenomena are observed within the somewhat smaller limits of the evidence. As regards the term employed, "elder" is used indifferently of Jewish (Acts 4: 5, etc.) or of Christian (Acts 11: 30, etc.) officials, with no hint that the functions of the two differed in any way. Christian elders were duly ordained (Acts 14: 23, *cf.* 20: 28). At Jerusalem they formed the collegiate governing body of the local church (Acts 11: 30) or, in other words, they were the Christian sanhedrin. When more precise language is used, this sanhedrin can be said to be composed of "apostles and elders" (Acts 15: 2, etc.), just as the Jewish body can be said to be composed of "chief priests and elders" (Acts 4: 23, 23: 14). And it is interesting to note that at Jerusalem, where the Jewish body had a permanent president in the high priest, the Christian body developed a permanent president in St. James.⁸

The evidence of Acts, combined with that of the Pastorals, shows the extent of the "presbyterial" scheme in the Church within the last couple of decades of the first century. As to its origin and the direction of its adoption the data of the New Testament are sufficient for tolerable orientation. The term first appears in Jerusalem (Acts 11: 30). The collegiate administration in Antioch (Acts 13: 1-3) is not quite the same thing, but at least it foreshadows the ordained ministry of a not much later period. St. Luke insists (Acts 14: 23) on the formal introduction of the polity into southern Asia Minor on St. Paul's first missionary journey; this is generally (and no doubt rightly)

⁸ That there is no evidence for such presiding officers elsewhere among the Christian elders is interesting; the Christian polity evidently spread directly from Palestine and was not copied from the Jewish communities on Hellenistic soil. This is corroborated by the geographical development of this method of organization (see below), as well as by the terminology used ("elder," not "ruler").

regarded as an anachronism, but the spread northwest from Antioch is wholly in the nature of things. The term is next found in Ephesus, where it is used as a matter of course in Acts 20:17, while the two Epistles to Timothy, whose atmosphere is Ephesian (1 Tim. 1:3, 2 Tim. 1:18), speak of the existence of elders as a recognized system. In Greece, however, Acts and the Pauline Epistles⁹ are silent on the theme,¹⁰ while Tit. 1:5 mention their introduction into Crete as something new, not accomplished (or only partially accomplished) by St. Paul himself. Their existence throughout most of Asia Minor seems taken for granted in 1 Pet. 5:1-4, perhaps in terms that may indicate a similar organization in Rome as well, while James 5:14 likewise takes their existence for granted, probably in Palestine.

Dates for the documents and (still more) uncertainty as to the reading back by them of later conditions make any attempt to fix a chronology somewhat hazardous, but perhaps the real adoption of the polity began in the seventh decade, and the more general acceptance in the eighth. The only other mention of elders in the New Testament are 2 Jn. 1 and 3 Jn. 1, but in these passages the term appears to denote a much higher rank than elsewhere except in 1 Pet. 5:1; it may, however, be a mere appeal to advancing age. But the silence of the latest parts of the New Testament is unimportant, for the all but universal¹¹ acceptance in the early second century of an organization which at least included elders is too familiar to require the citation of evidence.

So making all allowances for gaps in our knowledge, the general line of development is clear. Far from being an Hellenistic method of organization, as is sometimes argued even today, government by elders is a purely Jewish plan, taken over by Christianity first in Palestine and then extending roughly along the

⁹ The "bishops" of Phil. 1:1 (if they are not due to a gloss) seem to be something more embryonic, even though "bishop" and "elder" were synonymous for a time (see below).

¹⁰ In the Pauline Epistles, to be sure, the non-existence of elders appears to rest on something more than the mere argument from silence.

¹¹ The one significant exception is the Mesopotamian mission.

lines of the Pauline mission into Asia Minor and Europe.¹² And the plan carried into the Greek speaking world a terminology that even Greek Jews avoided.

As a matter of fact, the un-Greek character of "elder" as a title must have caused some confusion. In 1 Pet. 5:1-5 the impression is certainly produced that all the older men (contrasted in v. 5 with the "younger men") were elders. There is no such ambiguity in the Pastorals, as may be seen in 1 Tim. 5 by comparing verse 1 with verses 17-19; although the same term is used there is no possibility of a mistake in the meaning,¹³ while 1 Tim. 4:12 makes clear that an "elder" might be "young." But in 1 Pet. "elders" and "old men" are simply identified. This certainty arouses a suspicion that in adopting the organization some Gentile churches contrived to misunderstand it; that in certain localities it was felt (not unnaturally) that the rule of elders meant the rule of the more aged. If this is true, it is hard to believe that such "elders" were ordained, for that ordination came automatically when a certain number of years was attained is most improbable. But the language may be loose, perhaps because most elders were really old and most of the older men were actually elders. And it is to be noted that the same division of the community into "elders" and "young" reappears in 1 Clement 1:3 and 21:6, while there is no doubt that in 1 Clement the elders were a sharply limited and definitely ordained group. And, in any case, if such a government based purely on age ever really existed anywhere, it very quickly disappeared.

It is not surprising, however, that a tendency arose to replace "elder" by some less un-Greek word. And the term adopted was *ἐπίσκοπος*. Now it is abundantly clear today that, contrary to Hatch's famous theory, this usage was not derived

¹² Probably to the south as well, into Alexandria, although of the earliest extension of Christianity into Egypt we know nothing. However, the presbyterial system was later extraordinarily tenacious in Alexandria.

On pre-Christian and non-Jewish "elders" in Egypt cf. Vol. V, p. 318.

¹³ Tit. 2:2 uses a different word (*πρεσβύτερος*) for "old man."

from the terminology of Greek club life, for the occurrences of *episcopus* in inscriptions dealing with the Greek clubs are extremely rare. And, in particular, the treasurers of these clubs, on whom Hatch laid the greatest stress, were called almost anything rather than *ἐπίσκοπος*.¹⁴ The popularity of "*episcopus*" among Christians was due partly to the fact that the term was especially current in Palestine,¹⁵ partly to the fact that its quite unspecialized significance ("overseer") made it excellently adapted to describe the quite unspecialized duties of the elders.

That at some period and in some parts (at least) of the Church "*episcopus*" and "elder" were used interchangeably is seen on comparing Titus 1:5 with 1:7 and Acts 20:17 with 20:28. In these two cases the two words unquestionably mean the same thing. For it is very artificial to argue, as does, *e.g.*, Bernard,¹⁶ that the New Testament consistently recognizes a distinction between a larger body of "elders" and a smaller body of "*episcopi*" who were chosen from among the elders to have charge of worship. On the contrary, the qualifications given for the *episcopi* in the Pastorals have solely to do with governing, not with liturgical functions. And Archbishop Bernard finds himself obliged to argue that the latter part of St. Paul's address in Acts 20 is delivered only to the *episcopi* among the elders, while in discussing Titus 1:5-7 he has to maintain that "the elder must be blameless," etc., not to protect the office to which he is about to be ordained but to protect the "*episcopate*" to which he may possibly be ordained at some later period.¹⁷ Nor is it particularly helpful when H. St. John Parry,¹⁸ following the lead of older commenta-

¹⁴ The treasurer was most frequently called *λογιστής*; otherwise *μεριστής*, *ταμίης* (in Attica), *οἰκνόμος*, (in Egypt) or *διοικητής* (late). Cf. Poland, *Geschichte des griechischen Vereinswesens*, Leipzig, 1909, pp. 375-379.

¹⁵ Of the six inscriptions quoted by Poland (*op. cit.*, p. 377) that contain *ἐπίσκοπος*, three are from the Hauran (LeBas & Waddington, 1900, 2309, 2412e).

¹⁶ *The Pastoral Epistles*, Cambridge, 1899, pp. lxxii-lxxiii.

¹⁷ Next to the desire to defend some particular form of Church polity, the desire to maintain uniformity of terminology everywhere in early Christianity has probably done the most harm in discussing early Christian organization.

¹⁸ *The Pastoral Epistles*, Cambridge, 1920, pp. 74-75.

tors such as Hort or Bernard Weiss, holds that in "episcopus" we have not a second title convertible with "elder," but a description of the elder's functions. This may be tenable as a matter of pure exegesis, but the popular parlance of Christianity would not draw any such fine distinction between a title descriptive of the office and a title descriptive of the functions; either would be used indifferently as a title of the man.¹⁹

It does not follow, however, that in 1 Tim., which likewise uses both "elder" and episcopus," the two terms are similarly convertible. Indeed, a real exegetical awkwardness is relieved by the proposal²⁰ to regard "elders" as divisible into "ruling elders" (= "episcopi") and "serving elders" (= "deacons"). Some corroboration to this is found in 1 Clem. 42-44, where Clement after speaking of "episcopi" and "deacons" finally (44:5) uses "elders" to sum up both classes. Similarly it may be noted that "episcopi and deacons" is the description of all Christian officials in Phil. 1:1 and Did. 15:1; cf. Hermas, Vis. iii, 5. 1 ("apostles, episcopi, teachers and deacons").

But such uses of episcopus came to an end, when the term was adopted to describe the "bishop" in a very different conception of Church polity.

These elders, then, were the first class of Christian officials who were generally and regularly ordained.²¹ And the functions to which they were ordained were primarily identical with the functions of the Jewish elders, functions of administering the affairs of the local community on the basis of the Law of God as written in the Old Testament and interpreted (and ex-

¹⁹ Among other attempts to distinguish between "elder" and "episcopus" the least tenable is the theory that the episcopus passages in the Pastorals are late interpolations to defend the monarchical episcopate; such a theory involves holding that the interpolator omitted the statements most essential to his case. But it is of course conceivable that the variation of the terminology in 1 Tim. and Titus is due to the use of different sources. 1 Tim. 3: 1-7 and Titus 1: 7-9 are detachable from their context, and Dibelius has pointed out that these sections, which use the Hellenistic term episcopus, have other marked Hellenistic affinities (in Lietzmann's *Handbuch zum Neuen Testament*, iii, Tübingen, 1913).

²⁰ As in Parry, *op. cit.*, pp. lxxii-lxxiii.

²¹ Passing over the special problem in Acts 6: 1-6 for the present.

panded) by the teaching of Christ and the apostles ("the tradition"). And it may be well to note explicitly that such administration would include control of the financial affairs of the community as an essential part of the work. Such financial matters were under the control of all the elders, whatever individual agents may have been appointed as a matter of convenience.

But it was inevitable that the special problems of Christianity would result in entrusting to the elders—either from the beginning or in course of time—duties and privileges that were not shared by their Jewish namesakes. The most important of these is stated in 1 Tim. 5:17, "Let the elders who rule well be counted worthy of double honor, especially those who labor in the word and in teaching." The passage is quite clear. All elders "ruled" but among them there were inevitably some whose "ruling" was perfunctory by reason of limited capacity, inclination or leisure (few of the early Christian officials could have given their whole time to the task), especially if the Christians followed anything like the Jewish rule of requiring twenty-three elders for very moderate-sized communities. The burden of the administration would consequently fall on a nucleus of devoted individuals, as is the case in every organization everywhere. Then, as 1 Tim. 5:17 states, while all the elders were entitled to honor, the more active ones had a right to special regard.²²

But, in addition to "ruling," elders might most honorably undertake duties that did not strictly belong to their office by "laboring in the word and in teaching." This "teaching" is evidently distinguished from the instruction that was incidental to all judicial administration; as explained by the accompanying term "the word" it has to do with the formal preaching at the assemblies for worship.²³ Now, no doubt more of a link exists here between the Jewish and the Christian usage than appears at

²² That "double honor" may include a reference to "double honorarium" is possible in view of verse 18, but this interpretation is generally rejected by commentators; it certainly does not seem very probable.

²³ Very possibly also with formal missionary propaganda.

first sight. For the synagogue worship by this period had adopted an exposition of the Law in homiletic form as a constant feature (Lk. 4:20-21), and the elders of any locality would naturally figure largely among the Sabbath preachers. Hence, preaching by Christian elders would be nothing new. But in Christianity preaching was a far more central part of the worship, so much so that it was appraised as almost or quite sacramental in its character (1 Cor. 1:21, etc.). So responsibility for delivering the message correctly was serious, and it was bound to shift more and more towards those who had been trained and ordained as official expounders of "the tradition"; for authoritative preaching the communities were bound, sooner or later, to look chiefly to the group of the elders.

The Pastorals, in fact, presuppose that this development had reached a relatively advanced stage. Timothy, whom the elders are of course to imitate, is to "give heed to (public) reading, to exhortation, to teaching" (1 Tim. 4:13), to "preach the word" (2 Tim. 4:2). And, while most of the other references to teaching and exhortation may under a strict construction be limited to the more private instruction given by an elder,²⁴ the impression is fairly clear that a wider circle is envisaged, that the writer is thinking of public preaching to the community as a whole. To be sure, the Pastorals do not go so far as to limit preaching to the elders. On this theme they have nothing at all to say, but while the argument from silence certainly must not be pressed in such a case, the difference in outlook between the Pastorals and, *e.g.*, 1 Cor. 14:26, is obvious. Yet even in the Pastorals such preaching is more or less a voluntary responsibility for elders, and the spiritual gift that qualifies for such preaching is no essential part of the gift bestowed on ordination to the eldership.²⁵

²⁴ This is due to the fact that elders were at first more exclusively concerned with such instruction; here as elsewhere material in the Pastorals shows signs of an earlier origin.

²⁵ It may be noted, however, that the close conjunction of verses 13 and 14 in 1 Tim. 5 may show that a connection between the two gifts was being thought of. In 2 Tim. 1:6 there is no such association.

That the function of preaching came to be supplemented with the function of conducting the services in general would be a natural further evolution. Its progress is seen in the mention of (public) reading in 1 Tim. 4:13, but it becomes explicit in Jas. 5:14, where the elders exclusively have charge of administering unction; here the nature of Christian eldership has diverged decisively from the Jewish. But the most important rite at which the elders' distinction could and did become most significant was the eucharist. To be sure, the New Testament is wholly silent on the theme of eucharistic officiants; this can not be stated too emphatically. But the elders, who ruled the community and into whose hands the public preaching and reading were increasingly falling, would inevitably have become the persons who would naturally lead the most sacred service of all. This is not in the least to say that by the period of the Pastorals only elders could so officiate, for even in the second century we find the Didache directing that the eucharistic thanksgiving should be pronounced by a prophet, if any was present (Did. 10:7). But the Didache likewise provides that in the absence of prophets²⁶ their service shall be rendered by the "episcopi and deacons," that is (probably) by the elders.

Only one other point calls for explicit notice. It was stated in the first section of the present monograph²⁷ that in ordination to the Jewish eldership there is no certainty that the gift of the Spirit was necessarily thought to be conveyed.²⁸ But in the Christian communities there is no such doubt. For every Christian function the outpouring of the Spirit was the essential and inevitable preparation.

(To be continued)

²⁶ And teachers. This latter class will be discussed later.

²⁷ V, p. 315.

²⁸ It may be added in this regard that from the second Christian century to a considerably later period imposition of hands was not used in ordaining to the Rabbinate; a solemn pronouncing of the ordinand's name by competent authority was deemed a sufficient ceremony. But there was no thought that this made any difference in the Rabbi's "character."

THE THEOLOGICAL LITERATURE OF THE SYRIAC CHURCHES

By FRANK H. HALLOCK, Seabury Hall, Faribault, Minn.

Geschichte der syrischen Literatur. By Dr. Anton Baumstark. Bonn: Marcus und Webers, 1922, pp. xvi, 378.

Dr. Baumstark's *Geschichte* is, and will long remain, indispensable for every student of Syriac literature. It is not a book easily read; crowded with solid information most succinctly expressed, it is rather of the nature of an encyclopedia. In the text a brief account of each Syriac writer is given; in the footnotes, averaging about half of each page, full references to manuscripts, editions, and literature concerning the individual and his work generally. In the case of a few of the more important writers only do we find a fuller treatment, then each article becomes a definitive biography of the writer together with an evaluation of his work. In this latter class belong such articles as those dealing with Ephrem (pp. 31-52), James of Serug (pp. 148-158), James of Edessa (pp. 248-256), Bar Hebræus (pp. 312-320). Generally Dr. Baumstark's purpose is to give a very brief account of the author, full information as to manuscripts and printed texts. The book is the fruit of infinite labor and only possible from the hands of one who knows his subject so exhaustively as does the author. It becomes a guide book for every one who undertakes work in this field.

After noticing the general nature of the book, the first impression produced upon the mind of the reader, somewhat acquainted with other books on the subject, is the great advance in knowledge made within the course of a generation. Dr. Wright's *Short History of Syriac Literature*, based upon his article in the ninth edition of the *Britannica*, appeared in 1894; compared with the present work it is as the literary effort of a high school

boy compared with the work of a finished *littérateur*. Not that Dr. Wright did not know his subject, no one who knows his work can question his knowledge, but he was in a sense a pioneer, and as such Dr. Baumstark gives him his full measure of praise. Dr. Wright relied very largely upon Assemani,¹ little had been done, almost nothing apart from the study of Biblical texts, between Assemani's day in the early eighteenth century and Dr. Wright's own; so it is not surprising to find references to the *Bibliotheca* on almost every page of Dr. Wright's work. Assemani, like Baumstark himself, will never lose his position of importance; but between Dr. Wright's work and the present, unceasing activity in search has given us a wholly new knowledge of Syriac manuscripts, to say nothing of the publication of texts that has gone on incessantly. This has supplemented Assemani to such an extent that, were a work similar to his to be issued in these days, concerned only with Syriac literature, a conservative estimate would require that it be several times as large as Assemani's ponderous folios. Dr. Wright's work played a certain part in giving this impetus towards the searching for and locating of manuscripts; also to the writing of histories on the subject of Syriac literature, so we have the works of Nöldeke,² Brockelmann,³ O'Leary,⁴ Chabot,⁵ Duval,⁶ marking stages leading up to the finished product of Baumstark. These writers have made known to us more than 150 Syriac authors, contained in some 3,000 listed manuscripts. Duval says that in 1899 more than 200 volumes had been published.

This advance having been made and a library of texts edited, translated, published, a new sort of labor is demanded, *i.e.*, the collating of the evidence which this newly accessible literature

¹ J. S. Assemani, *Bibliotheca Orientalis Clementino-Vaticana*, Rome, 1719-1728, 4 vols.

² *Die Aramäische Litteratur*, Berlin, 1906.

³ *Die syrische und die christlich-arabische Litteratur*, Leipzig, 1909.

⁴ *The Syriac Church and Fathers*, London, 1901.

⁵ *Les langues et les littératures araméennes*, Paris, 1910.

⁶ *Anciennes Littératures Chrétiennes. II La Littérature Syriaque*, 3e edit., Paris, 1907.

supplies on a variety of subjects. In a sense such labor may be premature, much remains to be edited and published, much, perhaps, to be discovered; but we have ample for the establishment of the main lines of thought, which may easily be supplemented as new material is brought to light and made accessible; opinions may even have to be amended in the light of further knowledge; however, we have reached the point where analysis and synthesis of what is now available ought to be undertaken by scholars in a variety of fields. Such work *e.g.*, as Dr. Baumstark himself has done in his *Nichtevangelische Perikopenordnungen des ersten Jahrtausends*, or F. C. Burkitt in *The Early Syriac Lectionary System*. Both of these works happen to be in the field of liturgics, but like work is to be done in dogmatics, history, textual criticism and exegesis, etc. Dr. Duval has prepared the way for this undertaking, as the earlier part of his book groups the authors under the heads of the subjects upon which they have written. But the guidance which Duval supplies is to be worked out in detail, and here is work for a small army of laborers. The key to the understanding of the literature of these great Churches has been turned in the lock, but we can hardly be said to have entered the room. That which has been accomplished thus far is the road-making work of the linguists.

It is the chief purpose of this article to describe, in most inadequate form, some of the literature that is now available for study, and we shall preface no more concerning its history and general character than seems essential. Generally it is not of high originality. Wright, quoting and approving Renan, makes mediocrity a characteristic. It has neither the fire nor the spontaneity of Hebrew or Arabic literatures at their best; but the Syrians were good borrowers and imitators. On the side of orthodoxy Ephrem and Aphraates are almost the sole writers of originality; on the heterodox side we have the remains of Bardesanes and the Acts of Thomas (in which Thomas is described as the twin brother of Christ). This last contains the beautiful Hymn of

the Soul, not a part of the original work, perhaps the greatest single writing in the Syriac tongue. Apart from the original literature the translations are of high value, from the Greek, both of classical and Christian writers, especially. Syriac formed a link in the chain by which the knowledge of Greek philosophy, medicine, and natural history reached Western Europe in the Middle Ages, the Arabs having translated from the Syriac versions of the original Greek. Translations from the Pahlavi, *e.g.*, the Romance of Alexander and Kalilah and Dimnah, and also from the Arabic, are not without value. Not infrequently they have kept alive works otherwise lost. An added value is given the translation by the slavish literality of the translator, often wrenching his own idiom into an unfamiliar form that he might follow the original more closely.

The literature was at its best from the fourth to the eighth centuries. The Christological controversies of the fifth century rent Syria into two hostile camps, brought a few dialectic variations between the language of the East and of the West, and the use of different alphabets. The controversial works are naturally of the highest importance for determining the real position of Nestorian and Monophysite thought, and also for their conception of the teaching of orthodoxy. Decay began in the seventh century, partly as a result of the sufferings of the Persian War. Then came the Moslems and the replacement of Syriac as a spoken language by Arabic. It was in this respect that the Moslem invasion had in these quarters its greatest effect, for the native religion and life were left more untouched than elsewhere—Egypt especially. Kinship had much to do with this, more, perhaps, the fact that the Syrians were out of communion with the Christians of Europe, and the Arabs were wise enough to profit by this *odium theologicum*. One important result was that it caused the Syrians to lay aside for a time their internal strife and unite in a new apologetic in defense of the common Christianity. Syriac grammars and dictionaries appear in large number and bear witness to the need for training people in the

use and pronunciation of their own tongue, which still remains the ecclesiastical language. In the tenth century Jacobite literature almost disappeared, most of the few writers of this and the following century used Arabic. The eleventh century sees a slight revival of literary activity, Dionysius bar-Salibi, a Jacobite commentator and theologian, being especially noteworthy. The twelfth century marks the approach to the end, which is, however, not immediate. "As the lamp flares up before it expires, so the thirteenth century witnessed a faint revival of Syriac literature before its extinction" (Wright, p. 259). Bar Hebræus is conspicuous among the Jacobites and Ebedjesus among the Nestorians. The Nestorians continued to write a little longer, the last author being the Catholicus Timothy II, who died in 1328. This is, of course, only the end of Syriac as a literary language; it is still spoken by groups of Nestorians and "Chaldæans" (Uniats), numbering, perhaps, 300,000.⁷

The Church had its origin at Edessa, now Urfa, capital of the "buffer" kingdom of Osroene. Edessa was the only centre of early Church life speaking a language other than Greek, a dialect closely akin to Aramaic and, therefore, to Hebrew. Connected with its founding is the story of the correspondence between King Abgar and Christ, the sending of the disciple Addai, the conversion of the King and his people.⁸ It seems that Christianity was introduced not later than the middle of the second century,⁹ and that the first king to embrace the faith was

⁷ Duval, *op. cit.*, pp. 199-200; Brockelmann, *op. cit.*, pp. 65-66; lists later writings in which there is nothing of value, except as contemporary Syriac customs are revealed. The publishing activity of the Archbishop's Mission, the French Lazarists, and the American Protestant missions are making modern Syriac in some measure a literary language.

⁸ Euseb., H. E., i: 13; G. Phillips, *The Doctrine of Addai, the Apostle*, London, 1876, gives text and translation; the text in part is also given in Brockelmann's *Syrische Grammatik*, Berlin, 1912, pp. 12-21 of the Chrestomathy. See F. C. Burkitt, *Early Eastern Christianity*, lect. 1. Lipsius dates it at the beginning of the fourth century, it abounds in evident anachronisms. J. Tixeront, *Les Origines de l'Église d'Édesse et la Légende d'Abgar*, Paris, 1888, describes it as post-Nicene in thought and expression as well as date.

⁹ F. C. Burkitt, *op. cit.*, lect. 2, carries it back to 135 A.D.

Abgar IX, who reigned from 197 to 214 or 216 A.D. He was a contemporary of Bardesanes, 155-223 A.D., and may have acquired his first acquaintance with Christianity from him, as he was a familiar court figure, or he may have learned the faith at Rome, which he visited in the time of Zephyrinus. Palüt, the third bishop, received consecration from Serapion, Bishop of Antioch, 190-210 A.D., and apparently a schism between the old native Christianity and the followers of Palüt continued for some time. Burkitt thinks this old native Christianity furnished the soil out of which both Nestorianism and Monophysitism were to develop, just as Donatism flourished among the natives of North Africa. The Persian War in the fourth century made Christianity a national point of distinction in opposition to Zoroastrianism. In the fifth century appeared the two heresies which still continue to rend asunder the Christians of the East. As to the existence of actual heresy at the present time opinion is divided; on the whole the weight of scholarship appears to favor their orthodoxy. It is not the purpose of the present article to enter upon the subject, but to point out that we now have material available for treating the matter from first-hand sources. Expelled from Edessa in 489, a new centre was established at Nisibis. Narsai¹⁰ was the prominent figure in the early history of the school which flourished here. From this centre practically all Persian Christians were won over to the acceptance of Nestorianism, and from it also reached out the missionary activity which carried Christianity into distant India, Turkestan, Ceylon, China.

Edessa and Nisibis were the chief centres of all Syriac-speaking Christians, but it was the language of practically all writers east of Antioch; there Syriac was the vernacular, but Greek always from the days of S. Ignatius onwards the literary language, and the important school of theology which developed there was wholly Greek. The use of the language never reached its natural limits in the West, for Palestine and Asia Minor had be-

¹⁰ Some of his voluminous writings have been published by A. Mingana, Mosul, 1905.

come Greek speaking and remained so until the coming of the Arabs. Still there was a certain association of Syriac with Monophysite teaching, especially after the time of James Baradeus, and as this teaching spread, sections which had not before spoken Syriac adopted it in their liturgies, doctrinal formulas, and ecclesiastical usage generally. In the East the language accompanied Nestorianism in the same way and, as Nestorianism was conspicuous for its missionary zeal, the knowledge of Syriac was carried far, reaching even into China.¹¹ The lure of Egyptian monasticism had also drawn colonies of Monophysite monks thither and carried the knowledge of Syriac to the Thebaid.¹² From this it follows that in speaking of Syrian Christians we are referring not to the inhabitants of any particular land, but to those who used this language as their ecclesiastical tongue, a group larger at one time, it is said, than Greek- and Latin-speaking Christians united. So we group together Jacobites, Nestorians, Maronites,¹³ Syrian and Chaldaean Uniats, and the Christians of S. Thomas on the Malabar Coast of India.

More work has been done upon early Syriac Biblical versions than in any other field of this literature, full treatments of the subject are easily accessible,¹⁴ hence we pass it over briefly. The Pshitta or "Simple" (*cf.* Vulgate) version is the only one in ecclesiastical usage to-day and is used by all Syriac-speaking Christians. It is the earliest literary monument, apart from a few inscriptions. The story of its translation, though derived from the legend of Abgar, is not wholly unhistoric. The familiar name was not given it until some time in the eighth or ninth century, to distinguish it from a revised version prepared by Monophysite scholars under the direction of Philoxenus of

¹¹ For the liturgy vide E. Ranaudot, *Liturgiarum Orientalium Collectio*, Frankfort, 1847, Vol. 2, p. 563. See also the literature on the monument of Sigan-fu.

¹² See Liturgy of the Nile in *Jour. Royal Asiatic Soc.*, July, 1896.

¹³ A. Baumstark, *op. cit.*, pp. 335-343. To the Maronites we owe the valuable work of the Assemani.

¹⁴ Hastings's *Dict. of the Bible*, Vol. 4, pp. 645-652; F. C. Burkitt, *Early Eastern Christianity*, lect. 2.

Mabug (508 A.D.), Paul of Tella (615 A.D.), who followed Origen's Hexapla, and Thomas of Harkel, who published a revised translation of the New Testament in 615 A.D. In these versions the Old Testament was conformed more closely to the LXX, perhaps because that was the only version to which their Greek opponents appealed in controversy and it was alone regarded by them as Scripture. The Pshitta Old Testament goes back to the end of the second century at the latest; it seems to have been pre-Christian and made by a Jewish Community directly from the Hebrew, though influenced somewhat by the LXX.¹⁵ The old Syriac versions of the Gospels apparently never became popular and were soon replaced by the Diatessaron. Of these "Separate Gospels" (Ewangeliyōn da-Mpharrshe) we have two manuscripts: that discovered by Cureton in Egypt in 1842, and the palimpsest found by Mrs. Gibson in the Convent of Mt. Sinai in 1892; neither of these probably goes back of the fifth century. In the early days the Gospels were ordinarily read in a Syriac version of Tatian's Diatessaron, "Gospel of the Mixed" (Ewangeliyōn da-Mhalleṭe).¹⁶ It was a work of great popularity, upon which Ephrem wrote a commentary,¹⁷ and from which Aphraates' quotations are taken. Bishop Rabbūla, 411-435 A.D., destroyed the Diatessaron wherever he found it, as did also Theodoret of Cyrrhus, 423-457 A.D., who gathered up and burned more than two hundred copies; their work was so well done that not a single copy of the Syriac version has yet been found. To take the place of it Bishop Rabbūla set forth the New Testament Pshitta, using as a basis the old Syriac versions of the Gospels. The Diatessaron represented the Greek version used at Rome c. 170 A.D. Where the old Syriac Gospels differ from this they represent the Greek text used at Antioch, c. 200

¹⁵ C. Brockelmann, *op. cit.*, p. 9, says its influence upon later Syriac literature is comparable to that of Luther's *Bibel* upon German literature, and, we might add, to that of the King James version upon English literature.

¹⁶ It is still a matter of uncertainty whether this was first written in Greek or Syriac.

¹⁷ It is extant in an Armenian translation. But on the version which Ephrem used see F. H. Woods in *Studia Biblica*, Vol. 3, pp. 105-138.

A.D.; the differences in Rabbūla's version represent the Greek text of Antioch c. 400 A.D. The Pshiṭta remained unchanged among the Nestorians; a Patriarch, Mar Aba, is said to have prepared a revision c. 550 A.D., but we have no knowledge of it. The Nestorians were also much less active as commentators, and their work in the field of Biblical study generally was of less importance. In the main we have followed in this section F. C. Burkitt, but his opinions are not universally accepted and much yet remains to be done by New Testament textual critics.

Of the earliest writings we have left a work, *de Fato*, attributed to Bardesanes;¹⁸ it is in the form of a dialogue between a Christian and a pagan, and is concerned chiefly with answering the question—Why does God allow man to sin? Bardesanes, a follower of Valentinian, founded the only unorthodox party prior to that of Nestorius. He had a reputation for great learning and was a voluminous writer.

In Ephrem, c. 308–373 A.D., Syriac literature in its fondness for poetry already reaches its highest form, F. C. Burkitt has a low opinion of his intellectual powers, dwells upon his prolixity and paucity of ideas, and says his theology is best found in his *Sermo de Domino Nostro*,¹⁹ a sermon on the Incarnation. This judgment of Burkitt's is too sweeping,²⁰ but it is, nevertheless, unfortunate that the most widely spread knowledge of early Syriac literature should be derived from the translation of S. Ephrem, for the endless repetition in the verses, pleasing to

¹⁸ Euse., H. E., 4: 30. It is given in R. Graffin, *Patrologia Syriaca*, Paris, 1894, Vol. 2, pp. 492–657, under the title *Liber Legum Regionum*, together with all known material concerning the author. F. C. Burkitt, *op. cit.*, lect. 5, praises Bardesanes as the one original thinker, but as a matter of fact there appears to be little in Bardesanes that is distinctively Christian. R. B. Trolinton, *Clement of Alexandria*, Vol. 1, pp. 139–148, expresses an unduly laudatory opinion of Bardesanes.

¹⁹ This, together with two other homilies and the Nisibene hymns, will be found translated in the *N. and P-N. Lib.*, Vol. 13, pp. 115–431. Much of what has been attributed to him is to be assigned to his pupils, some is even later than the Arabic conquest.

²⁰ S. Jerome, *de Vir. Illust.*, 115, expresses a high opinion of Ephrem, and says his works were frequently read in the Church.

the Syriac ear, does not appeal to us. Verse long remained a favorite medium for the teaching of theology, even in the thirteenth century we find several poets.

Aphraates²¹ is an excellent example of early Syriac literature, wholly free from Greek influence: yet there is no point on which his theology is essentially different from that of contemporary Greek writers. His twenty-three homilies, published between 337-345 A.D., are not sermons, but a series of orderly expositions of the Christian faith addressed to an enquirer, similar to some of the treatises of S. Augustine.

From this account of the beginnings of Syriac literature we can not continue in detail.

Recent publications have necessitated the re-writing of much of our history, concerning the Nestorians especially, and the revision of our conceptions of their theology. These publications have made older works hopelessly out of date. Heretofore, much of our knowledge has been drawn from late and prejudiced sources, such as Bar Hebræus, as studied from the original sources it appears in quite a new and different light. In the *Synodicon Orientale*,²² containing the Acts of fourteen Councils of the Nestorian Church, extending from 410 to 780 A.D., together with a few other contemporary documents, we find much new material. Most surprising is the fact that the *Synodicon* contains the Acts of Chalcedon and the "Tome" of S. Leo;²³ furthermore these are referred to as of authority in a Synod of Mar Aba, 540 A.D. The *Synodicon* also throws an interesting sidelight upon the independent development of orthodox thought. The Church of Seleucia was spared all the turmoil and confusion of the Arian struggle and did not know of the Nicene Creed until 410 A.D., then it is at once accepted as being in harmony with the teaching of the native Church; but,

²¹ Text in R. Graffin, *op. cit.*, Vol. 1 and Vol. 2, pp. 1-150. Translated in part in *N. and P-N. Lib.*, Vol. 13, pp. 345-412.

²² Translated by J. B. Chabot and published Paris, 1902.

²³ M. Chabot does not include this section as the translation would be needless.

at the same time, this Synod shows its independence by accepting only those canons of the Nicene Council which commended themselves to them.

Another work of almost equal value is the *Histoire de Mshikha-Zca*,²⁴ containing biographies of bishops of Adiabene who lived between 90 and 550 A.D., thus carrying back the introduction of Christianity to a date considerably earlier. Another work, not a recent discovery, demanding more thorough study of the evidence which it supplies, is the *Ecclesiastical History* of John of Ephesus.²⁵ Also important for the filling in of gaps in our knowledge is the *Chronicon Edessenum*,²⁶ which records the history from 131 to 450 A.D., and is, on the whole, a reliable source. Among the multitude of other similar works we will stop only to notice Sir E. A. W. Budge's *Book of Governors*,²⁷ which interprets Syriac monastic life and contains many otherwise unknown documents bearing upon Nestorian history; and the *Documents Inédits*,²⁸ in which light is thrown upon the relations of Rome and the Nestorians in the sixteenth, seventeenth, and eighteenth centuries.

Theology²⁹ is to be found not only in special treatises upon dogmatic subjects but in all their literature. In the earlier centuries Syriac theological writing enables us in some measure to get back to conceptions not yet affected by Greek and Latin thought, at all events we can come closer to these conceptions than elsewhere. As in the case of the Old Testament we have to allow for the non-speculative character of Semitic thought. In later days when Aristotle in Syriac translation had become widely known certain changes appear, yet Aristotelianism never bore the fruit of scholasticism, being too alien to the fundamental characteristics of the writers to produce a far-reaching effect.

²⁴ Translated by A. Mingana and published at Mosul, 1907.

²⁵ A new edition is shortly to appear in the *Patrologia Orientalis*.

²⁶ The most complete edition is that of L. Hallier, Leipzig, 1892.

²⁷ Two vols., London, 1893, containing a valuable introduction.

²⁸ *Documents Inédits pour servir à l'Histoire du Christianisme en Orient*, edit. par Antoine Rabbath, Paris, 1905 sqq.

²⁹ See F. C. Burkitt, *op. cit.*, lect. 3.

Practicality remains a basic conception. Theology, as already noted, is to be looked for in all writings, hence we need not here particularize authors. It does not fall within the scope of our article to discuss the re-opening of the question—Was Nestorius a Nestorian?—as revived by the publication of the *Bazaar of Heraclides*. At all events it was so long before Nestorianism was officially recognized that there were possibilities of many changes having been made since the Council of Ephesus.³⁰

In the field of Patristics we have to deal both with works originally written in Syriac, as the *Clementine Recognitions* and *Homilies* very likely were, and with early translations which replace works otherwise lost or are helpful as early versions. The work of translation was begun at an early date. Pāmphilus, the patron of Eusebius, is said to have employed a body of scholars in translating Greek writings into Syriac. Of the many works which we know entirely or in part only as they exist in Syriac versions we may mention the *Testament of our Lord*, the *Apology* of Aristides, the *Festal Letters* of S. Athanasius, the *Theophany* of Eusebius, the writings of Severus of Antioch, missing portions of the *Epistle* of S. Polycarp, missing portions of the *Weights and Measures* of S. Epiphanius, the *Treatise* of Titus of Bostra against the Manichæans.

Liturgics has been more fully treated than any other subject in Syriac literature, except the study of Biblical texts. This moves R. Duval to omit the consideration of this subject and we follow his example, noting only that the last word has not yet been spoken. Neale's *General Introduction* is wholly out of date on many points and even F. E. Brightman's *Liturgies Eastern and Western* should be supplemented.

³⁰ We have still to learn more exactly what is intended to be conveyed by the Christological formula—"two qnome, one parsopa (prosopon), two natures." G. P. Badger, *The Nestorians and Their Rituals*, London, 1852, Vol. 2, pp. 424-425, "If the Nestorians would employ the term *Parsopa* always, and only, in the sense of *Person*, and would give up their other term for *Person*, by which sometimes they mean *Hypostasis*, and sometimes *Ousia*, they might find it far easier to receive the decrees of Ephesus. At all events, they would very much simplify the excessive mistiness of their own theological statements."

In the field of Biblical study, in spite of the great amount of work done in the study of versions, final results have not yet been reached, as we have already indicated. Study of the commentators will, however, produce larger returns. We find also interesting additions to the Apocryphas of both the Old and New Testaments.³¹

The ascetic literature has to do mainly with monasticism, yet much is of more general application, as the thirteen *Homilies* of Philoxenus of Mabug treating of Christian perfection. Scattered through all the literature fragments bearing upon mystical theology will be found; the works of pseudo-Dionysius were soon translated and widely appreciated. Stephen bar-Sudaila, early in the fifth century, one of the most notable of their mystic writers, falls into the pit of pantheism. Among others who avoided this ever-present danger were Theodosius of Antioch (887-986 A.D.) and Bar Hebræus.

We have tried to indicate the main lines of Syriac literature and the wealth of largely unworked material which it contains. Apart from the editions of particular writers much is published, translated into Latin or modern European tongues, in two great series of works, so that the student has not to do the initial work of translation.³² It would be helpful for him, however, occasionally in the more critical passages to have recourse to the text. Syriac, being closely related to Hebrew, will not be found difficult for him who has a knowledge of the latter language.³³

³¹ See R. Duval, *op. cit.*, ch. 8. A good illustration of New Testament Apocrypha will be found in Sir E. A. W. Budge's *History of the Blessed Virgin Mary and the History of the Likeness of Christ*, London, 1899, 2 vols.

³² The *Patrologia Orientalis*, continuing Graffin's *Patrologia Syriaca*, containing text and translation of Syriac, Coptic, Arabic, Ethiopic, Armenian, and a few Greek texts; Paris, 1907 sqq. Sixteen volumes have appeared. The *Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalium*, Paris, 1903 sqq. A work of like scope, of which eighty-five parts have appeared.

³³ The beginner will find the most helpful book to be T. H. Robinson, *Paradigms and Exercises in Syriac Grammar*, Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1915.

A NEW TESTAMENT BIBLIOGRAPHY FOR 1918 TO 1922 INCLUSIVE

By **FREDERICK C. GRANT**, Chicago

Nothing short of omniscience could justify a bibliographer in assuming that his work is complete. A finished bibliography would be an index to all current periodicals, as well as books, appearing anywhere in the world during the period covered. The best one can hope is that no book or article of first-rate importance has been overlooked.

I. GENERAL

- Heinrich Appel, *Einleitung in das N. T.*, Leipzig: Deichert, 1922, viii + 258 pp.
- Emory Barnes, *A Companion to Biblical Studies*, London, 1919.
- F. Barth, *Einleitung in das N. T.*, 5. Aufl., Gütersloh: Bertelsmann, 1920, 494 pp.
- J. H. Bernard, *Studia Biblica*, New York: Hodder and Stoughton, 1918.
- F. Böhl and A. van Veldhuizen, *Tekst en Uitleg. Prakt. Bibelverklaring*, Groningen: Wolters, 1915-22.
- Brown, *New Thoughts on an Old Book*, New York: Abingdon Press, \$1.00.
- H. J. Cadbury, *The Greek and Jewish Traditions of Writing History*; in Jackson-Lake, *Prolegomena to Acts*, II: 7-29; New York: Macmillan, 1922.
- M. A. Canney, *An Encyclopædia of Religions*, New York: Dutton, 1921, ix + 397 pp., \$10.
- Thos. Carter, *The Story of the N. T.*, Nashville: M. E. Church South Pub. Soc., pp. 205, \$.90.
- R. H. Charles, *The Teaching of the N. T. on Divorce*, London: Wms. and Norgate, 1921, xiv + 127 pp.
- C. Clemen, *Die Entstehung des N. T.*, 2. Aufl., Sammlg. Göschen, 1919, 167 pp.
- J. R. Cohu, *The Bible and Modern Thought*, New York: Dutton, \$4.
- G. A. Cooke, *The Bible and the Church*, CQR 88: 15-26.
- O. Eger, *Rechtsgeschichtliches zum N. T.*, Basel: Reinhardt, 1919, 46 pp.
- Elenchus Bibliographicus*, Biblica (Rome), I: 124-156, 286-300, 403-422, etc.
- P. Feine, *Einleitung in das N. T.*, 2. Aufl., Leipzig: Quelle und Meyer, 1918, 259 pp.
- L.-Cl. Fillion, *L'Étude de la Bible: Lettres d'un professeur d'Écriture Saint à un jeune Prêtre*, Paris, Letouzey, 1922, viii + 366 pp., 9/.
- H. L. Goudge, *The Interpretation of the N. T.*, CQR 93: 1-24.

- F. C. Grant, *A N. T. Bibliography for 1914 to 1917, Inclusive*, ATR I: 58-91.
- J. Hastings, assisted by J. A. Selbie and L. H. Gray, *Encyclopædia of Religion and Ethics*, Vols. 10 (1919—xx + 915 pp.), 11 (1921—xx + 916 pp.), 12 (1922—xxiv + 876 pp.); New York: Scribners, \$7 each.
- A. D. Heffern, *Apology and Polemic in the N. T.*, New York: Macmillan, 1922, xii + 411 pp., \$3.50.
- Die Heilige Schrift des N. T.*, edited by P. Dausch, F. Tillmann, A. Steinmann, J. Sickenberger, M. Meinertz, J. Rohr, and W. Vrede; Bonn: Haustein, 1918-1922.
- E. Jacquier, *Études de critique et de la philologie du N. T.*; Paris: Gabalda, 1920, vi + 515, 10/.
- E. Jacquier, *Histoire des livres du N. T.*, vols. III and IV, 5th ed., Paris: Gabalda, 10/ each.
- L'Abbé Janvier, *Evangiles des dimanches et des principales fêtes de l'année, avec des réflexions*, 220 pp., 14/.
- A. Jülicher, *Das N. T.* (Wissenschaftliche Forschungsberichte VI, 27-45), Gotha: Perthes, 1921.
- C. F. Kent, *The Shorter Bible: The N. T.*, Translated and Arranged by C. F. Kent; N. Y.: Scribners, 1918, xix + 305 pp., \$1.
- R. Knopf, *Einführung in das N. T.*, Giessen: Töpelmann, 1919, 394 pp.
- W. Lock, *William Sanday* (incl. bibliography), J. T. S. 85.
- A. Loisy, *Les Livres du Nouveau Testament*, Paris, Nourry, 1922, 719 pp.
- R. H. Malden, *Problems of the New Testament To-day*, Oxford University Press, 1923, 250 pp.
- S. Mathews and G. B. Smith, *A Dictionary of Religion and Ethics*, N. Y.: Macmillan, vii + 513 pp., 1921, \$8.
- J. Moffatt, *The Approach to the N. T.*, London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1921, 240 pp.
- A. S. Peake, ed., and A. J. Grieve (in N. T.), *A Commentary on the Bible*, London: Jack, N. Y.: Nelson, 1919, xxi + 1014, \$4.
- J. H. Penniman, *A Book about the English Bible*, N. Y.: Macmillan, 1919, 444 pp., \$2.25.
- W. Sanday, C. F. Burney, and C. W. Emmet, *The New Lessons Explained*, Oxford: Univ. Pr., 1920, xvi + 320 + 144 pp., 10/6.
- W. Sanday and C. W. Emmet, *The N. T. Background*, Oxford: Un. Pr., 1921, 1/6.
- A. Schlatter, *Erläuterungen zum N. T.*, 4 vols., 3. Aufl., Stuttgart: Calw, 1921-22.
- E. F. Scott, *The N. T. Today*, N. Y.: Macmillan, 1921, 92 pp., \$1.
- J. Sickenberger, *Kurzgefasste Einleitung in das N. T.*, 2d ed., Freiburg: Herder, 1920, 166 pp.
- J. E. Symes, *The Evolution of the N. T.*, London: Murray, 1921, 18/.
- C. H. Turner, *The Study of the N. T.*, 1883-1920, Oxf.: Un. Pr., 1920, 66 pp.
- G. W. Wade, *N. T. History*, London: Methuen, 1922, xi + 690 pp., \$7.
- J. Weiss, ed., *Die Schriften des N. T.*, 3d ed., 4 vols., Gottingen: Vandenhoeck und Ruprecht, 1918.

The Westminster Version of the Sacred Scriptures: A New Translation from the Original Greek and Hebrew Texts. The N. T., Vol. III, St. Paul's Epistles to the Churches. Edited by C. Lattey, S.J., and J. Keating, S.J.; N. Y.: Longmans, 1920, xviii + 85 pp.

H. W. Willoughby, *The Next Step in N. T. Study*, JR II: 2.

H. Windisch, *Literature on the N. T. in Germany, Austria, Switzerland, Holland, and the Scandinavian Countries*, 1914-20; HTR 15: 2 (pp. 115-216).

H. Windisch, *Bibliography of English and American Literature on the N. T.*, 1914-20, ZNTW 1921.

APPEL is very conservative; his book is a marvel of typography. BOEHL'S work is a series of translations and paraphrases with brief interpretations. COHU'S book, like his earlier ones, is intended for educated laymen and theological students. The bibliographies which have appeared in BIBLICA, in Jacquier's book, and the HTR have been exhaustive and are indispensable. One cannot but say a word of appreciation at this point regarding the very excellent journal which the Roman Catholic Biblical Commission has produced. A word should also be said apropos the completion in 1922 of the ERE, one of the most monumental productions in the history of learning. It will long remain a standard of reference for all students. HEFFERN holds a conservative view of the documents. He believes that a pre-Christian gnosis intruded into several churches before any of the New Testament documents were written. MALDEN is very conservative. TURNER surveys the progress of New Testament studies during the last three decades. WADE has produced a comprehensive and reliable work of introduction which might well be used as a vademecum by seminary students throughout their course.

I b. TEXT AND CANON

B. W. Bacon, *Marcion, Papias, and "the Elders,"* JTS 23: 90.

J. Bestmann, *Zur Geschichte des Ntl. Kanons*, Gütersloh: Bertelsmann, 1922, 136 pp.

T. H. Bindley, *Let Papias Speak for Himself*, Exp 88.

R.-P. Bodin, *Novum Testamentum Grec-Latin*, 1100 pp., 8/.

The Coptic Version of the N. T. in the Southern Dialect, otherwise called Sahidic and Thebaic, with Critical Apparatus, literal English translation, appendix, and register of fragments. Vols. 4 and 5, The Epistles of St. Paul, Oxford: Clarendon, 1920, viii + 456 + 588. 63/.

C. C. Edmunds and W. H. P. Hatch, *Gospel Manuscripts of the General Theo. Seminary*, New York, Cambridge: Harv. Un. Pr., 1918, 68 pp.

M. Goguel, *Le Texte et les Éditions du N. T.*, 74 pp., 7/50.

J. Hoh, *Die Lehre des Hl. Irenäus über das N. T.*, Münster: Aschendorff, 1918, 59 pp.

J. Leipoldt, *The Sahidic N. T.*, CQR 92: 33-68.

D. Plooi, *A Primitive Text of the Diatessaron*, Leyden, Sijthoff, 1923, 85 pp.

A. Pott, *Der Text des N. T.*, 2d ed., Leipzig: Teubner, 1919, 116 pp.

A. Pott, *De Textu Evangeliorum in Saeculo Secundo*; Mnemosyne, Leiden: Brill, 1920, two articles.

- E. Preuschen, *Untersuchungen z. Diatessaron Tatians*; Sitzgsber. Akad. Heidelb., 1918, pp. 63.
- W. S. Reilly, *Le Canon du N. T. et le Critère de la Canonicité*; Revue Biblique, 1921.
- H. A. Sanders, *The Washington MS. of the Epistles of Paul*, N. Y.: Macmillan, 1918, pp. 251-315, \$1.25.
- R. Schütz, *Der parallele Bau der Satzglieder im N. T. und seine Verwertung für die Textkritik und Exegese*, Göttingen: Vandenhoeck, 1920, 27 pp.
- A. Snoj, *Veteroslavica versionis Evangeliorum pro critica et exegesi s. textus momentum*, Biblica 3: 180-7.
- A. van Veldhuizen, *Het N. T.*, Groningen: Wolters, 1920, 316 pp.
- H. J. Vogels, *Beiträge z. Gesch. d. Diatessarons im Abendland*; Ntl. Abhdign. 8; viii + 152 pp., Münster: Aschendorff, 1919.
- H. J. Vogels, *Novum Test. Graece*: Textum recensuit, apparatus criticum ex editionibus et codicibus manuscriptis collectum, edidit . . . Düsseldorf: Schwann, 1920, xv + 661 pp., 20/.
- I. Wordsworth and H. I. White, *Nouum Testamentum Latine sec. edit. S. Hieronymi*; Pt. II, fasc. ii (Ep. ad Cor. Prima), Oxford: Clarendon, 1922, iv + 126 pp., 16/.

I C. HERMENEUTICS (GRAMMAR AND LEXICOGRAPHY)

- G. Abbott-Smith, *A Manual Greek Lexicon of the N. T.*, Edinburgh: Clark; N. Y.: Scribners, 1922, xvi + 512 pp., \$6.
- H. T. Andrews, *The Title 'kyrios' as applied to Jesus*, Exp 87.
- A. Autin, *L'Anathème*, 236 pp., 7/.
- F. Blass, ed. A. Debrunner, *Grammatik des Ntl. Griechisch*, 5th ed., Göttingen: Vandenhoeck and Ruprecht, 1921, xviii + 336 pp.
- V. Burch, *Circumcision of the Heart*, ET 29: 7.
- E. D. Burton, A Crit. and Exeg. Comm. on the Ep. to the Galatians; Appendix: *Detached Notes on Important Terms of Paul's Vocabulary*; N. Y.: Scribners, 1920, pp. 363-521.
- E. D. Burton, *Spirit, Soul, and Flesh: The Usage of 'pneuma,' 'psyche,' and 'sarx' in Greek Writings and Translated Works from the Earliest Period to 225 A.D.; and their equivalents 'ruach,' 'nephesh,' and 'basar' in the Hebrew O. T.*; Chicago: Un. Press, 1918, 214 pp., \$2.
- F. P. Cheetham, *Language and Style in the N. T.*, CQR 94: 302-21.
- A. Dale, *Origen on 'Our Daily Bread'*, Exp 91.
- J. de Zwaan, *Use of the Greek Language in Acts*, in Jackson and Lake, *Prolegomena to Acts*, II: 30-65.
- C. H. Dodd, *Pauline Illustrations from Recently Published Papyri*, Exp. 88.
- W. E. Evill, *The Faithful Sayings*, ET 29: 10.
- F. W. Farrar, *Texts Explained*, N. Y.: Doran, xviii + 372, \$1.50.
- A. H. Forster, *The Pronunciation of Greek in N. T. Times*, ATR 5: 108-15.
- B. P. Grenfell and A. S. Hunt, *The Oxyrhynchus Papyri*, Part XIV, London: Egypt Exploration Society, 1920, xiv + 244 pp., with 3 plates, 42/.

- J. M. Harden, *Dictionary of the Vulgate N. T.*, N. Y.: Macmillan (S. P. C. K.), 1921, xiv + 126, 4/.
- W. H. P. Hatch, "*It is Enough*," Exp 86.
- J. A. Hutton, "*And with all thy Mind*," Exp 88.
- J. C. James, *The Language of Palestine and Adjacent Regions*; Foreword by Sir E. W. Budge, Edinb.: Clark, 1920, xxii + 278 pp., \$7.
- J. R. Mantey, *Newly Discovered Meanings of 'oun'*, Exp 129.
- S. G. Mercati, *Note papirologiche*, Biblica 2: 229-39, and fig.
- P. M. Meyer, *Griech. Texte aus Ägypten*, Berlin: Weidemann, 1918, xiii + 233 pp.
- G. Milligan, *Greek Papyri*, Exp 87.
- J. Moffatt, "*Dead Works*," Exp 85.
- J. H. Moulton, *A Grammar of N. T. Greek*, Vol. II, Pt. i, ed. W. F. Howard, *Accidence and Word-Formation*, N. Y.: Scribners, 1919; Pt. ii, 1920; viii + 115 + 266, 7/ and 10/.
- J. H. Moulton and G. Milligan, *The Vocabulary of the Greek N. T.*, Part iv, London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1920.
- H. P. V. Nunn, *Christian Inscriptions*, N. Y.: Macmillan, 1920, pp. 48, \$.50.
- H. P. V. Nunn, *A Short Syntax of N. T. Greek*, 3d ed., Cambridge: Un. Press, 1920, xii + 144 + 36 pp., 4/.
- H. P. V. Nunn, *The Elements of N. T. Greek*, 2d ed., Camb.: Univ. Pr., 1919, x + 204 pp., 5/.
- W. M. Rankin, *Judging*, ET 29: 10.
- A. T. Robertson, *A Grammar of the Greek N. T. in the Light of Historical Research*, 3d ed., N. Y.: Doran, 1919, lxxxvi + 1454 pp., \$7.50.
- Fr. Roslaniec, *Sensus germinis et plenus locutionis 'Filius hominis'*, Rome: Typ. Polyglottis Vaticanis, 1920, viii + 206 pp.
- R. Somervell, *The Son of Man*, ET 29: 11.
- T. Stephenson, *The title 'Son of Man'*, ET 29: 8.
- C. C. Torrey, "*Strain out a gnat and adorn a camel*," HTR 14: 2.
- C. J. Tottenham, *The Gates of Hell*, ET 29: 8.
- B. B. Warfield, *The Terminology of Love in the N. T.*, Princeton Th. Rev. 16: 1.
- H. G. E. White, *The Sayings of Jesus from Oxyrhynchus*, Cambridge: Univ. Pr., 1920, lxxvi + 48 pp., 12/6.
- F. Zorell, *Notæ lexicales*, Biblica 1: 264-5.

ABBOTT-SMITH is an up-to-date and quite compendious manual. BURTON's lexical notes are exceedingly important, and should not be overlooked by students of early Christian literature. HARDEN's dictionary will be useful to the increasing numbers of Vulgate-students. JAMES gives a valuable discussion of the limits of Aramaic speech in ancient Palestine. MOULTON's grammar continues to appear posthumously, under the able editorship of Mr. Howard, and ROBERTSON's encyclopedic work is either now or shortly to appear in its fourth edition. Nothing could better indicate the widespread interest in the subject, or the value of this grammar, than its successive editions, called forth in spite of the war, and high costs of book-making.

1 d. HISTORY OF NEW TESTAMENT TIMES

1. Judaism

- J. Abelson, artt. *Recording Angel, Righteousness*, ERE 10.
 I. Abrahams, art. *Sabbath*, ERE 10.
 I. Abrahams, artt. *Sanhedrim, Sects (Jewish)*, ERE 11.
 S. Angus, art. *Zealots*, ERE 12.
 B. W. Bacon, *John as a Preacher of Justification by Faith*, Exp 93.
 J. A. Bewer, *Der Text des Buches Ezra*, Göttingen: Vandenhoeck, 1922.
 G. H. Box and R. H. Charles, *The Apocalypse of Abraham and Ascension of Isaiah*, London: S. P. C. K., 1917 and 1918; xxxiv + 99 and xxvi + 62, \$1.80.
 G. H. Box, art. *Sadducees*, ERE 11.
 G. H. Box, *Who Were the Sadducees?* Exp 85.
 G. H. Box, *Scribes and Sadducees in the N. T.*, Exp 90.
 E. W. Brooks, *Joseph and Asenath*, London: S. P. C. K., 1918, \$1.25.
 L. E. Browne, *Early Judaism*, Camb. Univ. Pr., 1920, xiv + 204, 14/.
 A. Buchler, *Types of Jewish-Palestinian Piety, from 70 B.C.E. to 70 C.E.: The Ancient Pious Men*; London: Oxf. Univ. Pr., 1922, 264 pp., 6/.
 A. Cohen, *The Babylonian Talmud, Tractate Berākōt*, Cambridge Univ. Pr., 1921, pp. 460.
 H. Denby, *Tractate Sanhedrin-Mishna and Tosefta* (Translated), N. Y.: Macmillan, 1919, xxi + 148 pp., 6/.
 Eliphas-Levi, *Les Mystères de la Kabbale*, 40/.
 C. W. Emmet, *The Third and Fourth Books of Maccabees*, London: S. P. C. K., 1918, \$1.50.
 W. J. Ferrar, *The Uncanonical Jewish Books: A Short Introduction to the Apocrypha and Other Jewish Writings, 200 B.C. to 100 A.D.*, London: S. P. C. K., 1918, 112 pp., 3/.
 M. Gaster, *Recent Publications of Apocryphal Pseudepigrapha*, ET 29: 8.
 E. Grant, *The People of Palestine*, Phila.: Lippincott, 1921, ill., 271 pp., \$2.50.
 A. W. Greenup, *Taanith (On the Public Fasts), from the Palestinian Talmud*, London: Palestine House, pp. 132, 6/6.
 H. Höpfl, *Das Chanukafest*, Biblica 3: 165-79.
 F. J. Foakes-Jackson and K. Lake, *The Background of Jewish History*, in Proleg. to Acts, I: 1-34. *Varieties of Thought and Practice in Judaism*, ib., 82-136. *The Dispersion*, ib., 136-68. *The Zealots*, ib., 421-5. *The Slavonic Josephus*, ib., 433-5. *Differences in Legal Interpretation Between Pharisees and Sadducees*, ib., 436-8.
 M. R. James, *Salathiel qui et Esdras*, JTS 19: 76.
 H. A. A. Kennedy, *Philo's Contribution to Religion*, London: Hodder, 1919, x + 245 pp.
 S. Krauss, *Synagogale Altertümer*, Berlin: Harz, 1922, viii + 470 pp., ill.
 S. Langdon, *The Release of a Prisoner at the Passover*, ET 29: 7.
 C. Lattey, *A note on the Mishna: Passover 7:9s*, Biblica 2: 347-53.
 H. M. J. Loewe, art. *Worship (Jewish)*, ERE 12.

- C. G. Montefiore, *An Ancient Arraignment of Providence (II Esdras)*, Hibb. Jour. 17: 261-71.
- C. G. Montefiore, *Liberal Judaism and Hellenism*, London: Macmillan, 1918, xii + 328.
- C. G. Montefiore, *The Spirit of Judaism*, in Jackson-Lake, Prol. to Acts, I: 35-81.
- J. A. Montgomery, *The Religion of Flavius Josephus*, JQR 11: 3.
- G. F. Moore, *Intermediaries in Jewish Theology*, HTR 15: 41-86.
- G. F. Moore, *The Am Ha-Areṣ (the People of the Land) and the Haberim (Associates)*, in Jackson-Lake, Prol. to Acts, I: 439-45.
- W. O. E. Oesterley, *The Sayings of the Jewish Fathers (Pirke Aboth)*, London: S. P. C. K., 1919, 5/.
- E. J. Price, *Jewish Apocalyptic and the Mysteries*, Hibb. Jour. 18: 95-112.
- J. J. Price, art. *Shekinah*, in ERE 11.
- J. Reitzenstein, *Rabbinic Wisdom*, Cincinnati: Am. Heb. Un., 1921.
- N. Schmidt, art. *Sects (Samaritan)*, in ERE 11.
- H. S. Thackeray, *Selections from Josephus*, N. Y.: Macmillan, 1920, 5/.
- H. S. Thackeray, *The LXX and Jewish Worship (Schweich Lectures)*, London: Milford, 1922, 143 pp., \$2.
- A. L. Williams, *Tractate Berakoth*, Translated from the Hebrew, with Int. and Notes, London: S. P. C. K., pp. xxvi + 96, 6/.

The S. P. C. K. edition of the Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha is most useful to students for class-room work and is uniformly well edited. The editions of Talmudic Tractates which have recently appeared add to the materials with which the New Testament student must familiarize himself. It is useless to attempt to understand the New Testament or to interpret it historically with no regard to its Jewish background. KRAUSS has supplemented his late work on the Talmud by one upon Synagogue Archaeology. According to MOORE the "people of the land" were "ignorant of the duties and observances of religion—if not of the rudiments, at least of the refinements on which so much was spent in the schools! On the other hand, the educated constituted a social class, and in their own estimate the most respectable class in the community, and 'scrupulous' Jews formed an association (ḥabūrah), the members of which were pledged to keep themselves pure from ceremonial defilement and to set apart with meticulous exactness the portion of the products of the soil which were by the Law to be given to the Priests (terūmah gedōlah) or to the Levites (tithes)." THACKERAY is valuable on the Jewish calendar.

2. Hellenism

- E. V. Arnold, art. *Stoics*, in ERE 11.
- E. Bevan, *Hellenism and Christianity*, N. Y.: Doran, 1922, 275 pp., \$3.
- A. Budelot, *Le Monde antique à l'évènement du Christianisme*, 1/50.
- F. Cumont, *After Life in Roman Paganism*, New Haven: Yale Un. Pr., 1922, pp. xv + 225, \$3.
- H. T. F. Duckworth, *The Roman Provincial System*, in Jackson-Lake, Prol. to Acts, I: 171-217.

- L. R. Farnell, *Greek Hero Cults and Ideas of Immortality*, Oxford: Un. Pr., 1921, pp. xvi + 434, 18/ (\$7.20).
- W. W. Fowler, art. *Roman Religion*, in ERE 10.
- L. Friedlander, *Darstellungen aus der Sittengeschichte Roms*, 9th ed., 3 vols., Leipzig: Hirzel, pp. vii + 369.
- J. Glasse, *The Mysteries and Christianity*, Edinb.: Oliver and Boyd, 1921, pp. 296.
- C. F. Jean, *Le Milieu Biblique avant Jésus-Christ*, I Histoire et Civilisation, Paris: Geuthner, 1922, pp. xxi + 339, 20/.
- H. C. O. Lanchester, art. *Sibylline Oracles*, in ERE 11.
- B. Latzarus, *Les Idées religieuses de Plutarque*, pp. 174, 15/.
- A. Loisy, *Les Mystères païens et le Mystère chrétien*, Paris: Nourry, 1919, pp. 368, 10/.
- C. H. Moore, *Life in the Roman Empire at the Beginning of the Christian Era*, in Jackson-Lake, Prol. to Acts, I: 218-262.
- C. H. Moore, *Pagan Ideas of Immortality during the Early Roman Empire*, Cambridge: Harvard Un. Pr., 66 pp., \$1.
- P. E. More, *The Religion of Plato*, Princeton Un. Pr., 1921, pp. xiii + 352, \$3.
- L. Patterson, *Mithraism and Christianity; a Study in Comparative Religion*, Cambridge Univ. Pr., 1921, pp. ix + 102, \$2.
- K. Reinhardt, *Poseidonios*, München: Beck, 1921.
- T. F. Royds, *Virgil and Isaiah: A Study of the "Pollio,"* with Tr., Notes, and Appendices, Oxford: Blackwell, 1918, pp. xiii + 122.
- H. D. Sedgwick, *Marcus Aurelius*, New Haven: Yale Un. Pr., 1921, pp. 310, \$3.
- Sheldon, *Mystery Religions and the N. T.*, N. Y.: Abingdon, \$1.
- P. Shorey, art. *Righteousness (Greek and Rom.)*, in ERE 10.
- G. Showerman, art. *Taurobolium*, in ERE 12.
- H. Windisch, *Das N. T. und seine Umwelt*, Th. Tijdschr. 10: 6.
- W. J. Woodhouse, art. *Slavery (Gk.-Rom.)*, in ERE 11.

BEVAN has written a series of charming essays in interpretation, valuable for the student of the world-backgrounds of early Christianity. CUMONT has added to his series of books upon Hellenistic religion by his Yale lectures upon immortality in Roman belief. FARNELL, the author of "Cults of the Greek States," has discussed the whole development of Greek ideas of immortality. It is MORE's belief that Greek religious and philosophic thought was a continuous process from Plato to Saint Chrysostom and the Fifth century. His book is the first volume in a series on The Greek Tradition. PATTERSON points out the similarities and contrasts, the strengths and weaknesses of the two competing religions. He admits a partial revelation of divine truth in Mithraism; but discards the theory of any influence of Mithraism upon Christianity. SEDGWICK has a useful exposition of the Stoic philosophy.

I e. PRIMITIVE CHRISTIANITY

- B. W. Bacon, *Jesus and Paul*, N. Y.: Macmillan, 1921, \$2.50.
- W. Bauer, *Ignatius and Polycarp* (tr. and notes), in Supplement to Lietzmann's Handbuch z. N. T., 1920.

- C. A. Bernouilli, *Johannes der Täufer und die Urgemeinde*, Leipzig: Neue Geist Verlag, 1918, pp. 504.
- H. J. Cadbury, *The Basis of Early Christian Anti-Militarism*, JBL 37: 66-94.
- P. Carrington, *Christian Apologetics of the Second Century*, London: S. P. C. K., N. Y.: Macmillan, 1921, pp. 155.
- A. Causse, *Essai sur le conflit du Christianisme primitif et la civilisation*, Paris: Leroux, 4/.
- J. de Zwaan, *Imperialisme van den oudchristelijken geest*, Haarlem: F. Bohn, 1919, pp. 390.
- C. L. Dibble, *Primitive Symbolism in the Breaking of Bread*, ATR 5: 187-210.
- B. S. Easton, *The Development of Apostolic Christology*, ATR 1: 148-163, 371-82.
- B. S. Easton, *Jewish and Early Christian Ordination*, ATR 5: 308-19.
- B. S. Easton, *Self-Baptism*, AJT 24: 4.
- L. P. Edwards, *The Transformation of Early Christianity from an Eschatological to a Socialized Movement*, Menasha, Wis.: Collegiate Pr., 1919.
- L. Fonck, *Die Echtheit von Justins Dialog gegen Trypho*, Biblica 2: 342-7.
- T. R. Glover, *Jesus in the Experience of Men*, N. Y.: Assoc. Press, 1921.
- F. Granger, *The Medical Significance of the Gospel*, Exp 89.
- F. Granger, *The Revolutionary Significance of the Gospel*, Exp 93.
- F. C. Grant, *The Early Days of Christianity*, N. Y.: Abingdon, 1922, pp. 320, \$1.75.
- C. Guignebert, *Le Christianisme antique* (Bibliothèque de philosophie scientifique), 270 pp., 7/50.
- F. H. Hallock, *Marcion*, ATR 5: 211-23.
- A. von Harnack, *Marcion: das Evangelium vom Fremden Gott; Eine Monographie zur Geschichte der Grundlegung der Katholischen Kirche*, Leipzig: Hinrichs, 1921, pp. xv + 357. *Neue Studien zu Marcion*, do., 1923, pp. 36.
- A. von Harnack, *Die Terminologie der Wiedergeburt und verwandter Erlebnisse in der ältesten Kirche*, Leipzig: Hinrichs, 1918.
- R. Harris, *The New Song of the Christian Church*, Exp 91.
- L. M. A. Haughwout, *Steps in the Organization of the Early Church*, ATR 3: 31-50.
- P. J. Heawood, *Some Aspects of Baptism in the N. T.*, ET 29: 9.
- K. Kautsky, *Der Ursprung des Christentums*, 9th ed., Stuttgart: Dietz, 508 pp., 9/.
- E. E. Kellett, art. *Rewards and Punishments*, in ERE 10.
- H. A. A. Kennedy, *Vital Forces of the Early Church*, London: S. C. M., 1920, pp. 160, 2/6.
- R. Knopf, *Didache and I and II Clement* (tr. and notes), in Supplement to Lietzmann's Handbuch z. N. T., 1920.
- K. Lake, *Landmarks in the History of Early Christianity*, N. Y.: Macmillan, 1922, 133 pp., \$1.25.
- K. Lake, *The Problem of Christian Origins*, HTR 15: 97-114.
- T. S. Lea and F. B. Bond, *Materials for the Study of the Apostolic Gnosis*, Boston: Marshall Jones, 1920, 127 pp., \$4.50.

- H. Leisegang, *Pneuma Hagion: Der Ursprung des Geistesbegriffs der synoptischen Evangelien aus der griech. Mystik*, Leipzig: Hinrichs, 1922, 150 pp., \$1.92.
- A. Loisy, *Les premières années du Christianisme*, RHLR 1920, 161-80.
- A. Mackie, *The Gift of Tongues: A Study in Pathological Aspects of Christianity*, N. Y.: Doran, 1921, 275 pp., \$2.
- F. Meffert, *Das Urchristentum*, München: Volksverein, pp. viii + 528.
- E. T. Merrill, *The Alleged Persecution of Christians by Domitian*, ATR 2: 1-26.
- E. T. Merrill, *On 'Clement of Rome,'* AJT 22: 3.
- E. T. Merrill, *Tertullian on Pliny's Persecution of Christians*, AJT 22: 1.
- E. Meyer, *Ursprung und Anfänge des Christentums*, I Die Evangelien, 1921; II Entwicklung des Judentums und Jesus von Nazaret, 1921; III Die Apostelgeschichte und die Anfänge der Christentums, 1923, Stuttgart and Berlin: Cotta.
- F. Palmer, *A Comparison of the Synoptic, Pauline, and Johannine Conceptions of Jesus*, AJT 23: 3.
- E. Pistelli, *Il Protevangelo di Jacopo* (tr.), Lanciano: Carabbo, 1919, 126 pp.
- J. A. Robinson, *Barnabas, Hermas, and the Didache*, London: S. P. C. K., 1920.
- T. Schmidt, *Der Leib Christi*, Eine Untersuchung zur urchristl. Gemeindegedenken, Leipzig: Deichert, 1919, 256 pp.
- C. A. A. Scott, *Dominus Noster: A Study in the Progressive Recognition of Jesus Christ our Lord*, London: Heffer, 1918, 6/.
- E. C. Selwyn, *First Christian Ideas*, London: Murray, 1919, pp. xlv + 241, 9/.
- I. Singer, *The Rival Philosophies of Jesus and Paul*, Chicago: Open Court, 1918, 347 pp.
- C. R. Smith, *The Bible Doctrine of Society in its Historical Evolution*, Edinb.: Clark, 1920, pp. xviii + 400, \$4.50.
- F. Streatfield, *The Influence of Judaism of the Greek Period on the Earliest Development of Christianity*, N. Y., 1918.
- T. Sugai, *The Development of the Apostolic Idea of Messiah*, The Study, 9: 3.
- C. W. Votaw, *Primitive Christianity an Idealistic Social Movement*, AJT 22: 1.
- J. P. Whitney, *The Second Century*, N. Y.: Macmillan, 1919, pp. viii + 135.
- H. Windisch, *Barnabas* (tr. and notes), in Supplement to Lietzmann's Handbuch z. N. T., 1920.

BACON's study is intensely valuable and constructive. According to EASTON the church "began in possession of Christ's claim to be celestial Messiah, judge of living and dead, author of resurrection, dispenser of the Spirit. And, in its own experience, the Church realized him as Lord, giver of mystical union, hearer of prayer. The proper description of his rank in the available categories was a task with which Christians struggled for two generations. The hypostasis doctrine offered a preliminary solution, but this solution could not be permanent; the hypostases had no true personality, while Jesus Christ was above all things intensely personal. Hence, the inevitable result—acting as God, alongside of God, in God, and *personal* and, therefore—God." LAKE's

little volume gives a summary of his views, writ larger in the "Prolegomena to Acts." LEA and BOND indulge in extravagant studies of gematria. LEISEGANG is equally extravagant. MACKIE gives a considerable amount of source material for the later developments or revivals of glossolalia. MERRILL has grave doubts about some of the persecutions. MEYER's work will be welcomed by all who know of his achievements in the general field of the History of Antiquity; in the volumes named, he draws the background of Jewish religion and of world-history; his position for the most part is distinctly conservative. The Supplement to Lietzmann's HZNT is comparable to the fine work done on the NT in earlier volumes.

I f. ARCHÆOLOGY AND GEOGRAPHY

- K. Bauer, *Antiochia in der ältesten Kirchengeschichte*, Tübingen, 1919.
 G. Dalman, *Orte und Wege Jesu*, 2. Aufl. Gütersloh. Bertelsmann, 1921.
 A. Gray, *The Last Chapter of St. John's Gospel as Interpreted by Early Christian Art*, Hibb. Jour. 20: 690-700.
A Guide to the Early Christian and Byzantine Antiquities in the Dept. of British and Mediæval Antiquities, 2d ed., Lond.: Brit. Mus., 1921, pp. xii + 192, ill., 2/6.
 H.-L. Janssens, *Au pays du Messie*, 420 pp., 25/.
 B. Meistermann, *Capharnaüm et Bethsaïde*, xx + 296 pp., 12/.
 G. F. Moore, *Nazarene and Nazareth*, in Jackson-Lake, Prol. to Acts, I: 426-32.
 The new edition of DALMAN is warmly welcomed.

(To be continued)

NOTES, COMMENTS, AND PROBLEMS *

The latest number (19) of the *Forschungen zur Religion und Literatur des Alten und Neuen Testaments* (Göttingen, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1923) is a highly important series of studies collected in honor of Hermann Gunkel's sixtieth birthday and issued under the title ETXAPIETHPION. The volume is in two parts, totalling 665 pages, and the list of contributors is a sufficient index to the weight of the contents: Emil Balla, W. Baumgartner, R. Bultmann, M. Dibelius, O. Eissfeldt, H. Gressman, M. Haller, J. Hempel, G. Hölscher, P. Kahle, S. Mowinckel, Hans Schmidt, K. L. Schmidt, B. Violet, P. Volz, H. Weinelt, and H. Windisch. Hans Schmidt is the editor and a bibliography of Hermann Gunkel is included, which runs to something like three hundred titles. Symptomatic of the most modern interests in Biblical study is the amount of space devoted to "style-critical" themes, a field in which, to be sure, Dr. Gunkel was practically the pioneer.

Another important volume of essays is Harnack's *Erforschtes und Erlebtes* (Giessen, Töpelmann, 1923). Most significant is a series of fourteen papers on the Reformation and allied topics, issued chiefly in connection with the Luther quadricentennial. A half dozen letters and articles on the war have a 'strangely outmoded sound today, although another series on the effects of the war on German scholarship and academic life make very poignant reading. A few miscellaneous essays, some "In Memoriam" speeches and four interesting sermons complete the volume.

Vandenhoeck and Ruprecht, of Göttingen, announce the immediate publication of two new volumes of the current revision of Meyer's *Kritisch-exegetischer Kommentar über das Neue*

* This department is now edited by Professor Burton Scott Easton, D.D., of the General Theological Seminary, New York City.

Testament, namely II Corinthians, now edited by Windisch, and Hebrews by von Dobschütz. Even with these additions the series is still very incomplete, as the volumes on the Gospels, Romans and Galatians, are out of print, while those on the Imprisonment Epistles, the Pastorals, and the Johannine Epistles are superannuated. It is announced, however, that Dr. Jülicher is revising Romans and Galatians. The new editors incidentally, denote a radical change in the policy of the work. Up to the current revision the series was kept in the hands of first-rate conservative scholars, but it is passing now into the control of the "liberal" school; doubtless the publishers felt that the Zahn series, with its enormous sales, amply satisfies the claims of German conservatism. New Testament students will await with interest the names of the editors to whom the revision of the work on the Synoptists will be entrusted.

The same publishers announce the publication of a revision of Nestle's familiar *Einführung in des Griechische Neue Testament* by Dr. von Dobschütz.

That invaluable series, *Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalium*, in suspense since 1914, has been revived and will appear regularly from now on. The editors remain the same but the publication has been transferred from Harassowitz of Leipsic to Paul Geuthner of Paris.

Two volumes just published would seem to make almost a record in authors' and publishers' leisureliness. One is the second volume of Sohm's *Kirchenrecht*, issued thirty-one years after the appearance of the first volume and six years after the distinguished author's death. While it is not so likely to create a revolution in method as was the case with the former volume, it is hailed already by the reviewers as a most remarkable interpretation of the spirit of the Middle Ages. The other work is the *Novum Testamentum Sancti Irenæi* in the "Old Latin Biblical Texts" series. This book was announced as far back as 1885 and the first proof sheets were sent to the editor, Dr. Sanday, in 1893. Dr. Sanday was always ultra-cautious in his work—it

will be remembered that he never finished the Life of Christ that he undertook twenty-five years before his death, although he was constantly engaged on it—and between his deliberate methods and various external sources of delay the revision of the proofs spun itself out for three decades. As Dr. Sanday died in 1920 the work was completed by Dr. C. H. Turner.

An interesting discussion of the Koridetho Codex was published in the *Harvard Theological Review* of last July ("The Text of the Gospels and the Koridetho Codex," by Kirsopp Lake and R. P. Blake). This is a valuable study of a very perplexing document.

M. M. Lecoffre, of Paris, announce the immediate appearance of *L'Évangile selon Saint Matthieu* by Père Lagrange, completing the series on the Synoptic Gospels by the most scholarly of Roman Catholic commentators.

Of all the theories regarding the authorship of Hebrews it has been reserved to Professor J. V. Brown to propound one that is entirely new. He thinks that in substance the Epistle is the work of St. Stephen, published after his death with a few revisions. (*Bibliotheca Sacra*, October, 1923.)

The regretted news of the death of Miss Lily Dougall on the 9th of last October follows the death of her friend and collaborator, Mr. Cyril W. Emmett, by only three months. Miss Dougall was sixty-five years of age and was well known as a novelist in the closing two decades of the last century. In 1900 she turned her attention to religion with her *Pro Christo et Ecclesia* (published anonymously) and followed it with a number of suggestive religious works, the most important being *The Lord of Thought*, written in conjunction with Mr. Emmet last spring. Apart from her literary labors, Miss Dougall figured largely as a patroness of the Modern Churchmen's Union in all its aspects and her home at Cumnor was a center for meetings and discussions. She will be remembered in this country as a leading figure at the Wellesley Conference last summer.

The Paddock lecturer for 1922, Mr. O. C. Quick, has resigned

his canonry at Newcastle to accept a similar appointment at Carlisle. His latest work, *Christian Belief and Modern Questions*, has just been published by the Student Christian Movement, of London.

Dr. Herbert Cushing Tolman died at the beginning of last December. A clergyman of the Episcopal Church, he was widely known for his work in Oriental studies, particularly in Persian inscriptions.

B. S. E.

"The Desk Kalendar with Lectionary for 1924," published by the Morehouse Publishing Co., Milwaukee, Wisconsin, is compact and indispensable to every well-ordered church. Its Table of Lessons for Special Occasions and Use of the Psalter are special features.

S. A. B. M.

Bishop Manning's masterful sermon on *Fundamentalism or Modernism*, preached at the consecration of Bishop Freeman, is to be had from the National Cathedral Foundation, 1417 K Street, N.W., Washington, D. C.

S. A. B. M.

We welcome the new monthly *Applied Religion*, a Magazine of Health and Healing, published by the Rev. F. C. Sherman, at the Temple Press, Cleveland, Ohio. This first number contains some excellent material.

S. A. B. M.

Two most excellent papers have been reprinted from the *Methodist Quarterly Review* for July and August, 1923. They bear the titles "Blood: Marriage Contracts" and "Blood: Cult of the Dead." The author, Dr. A. H. Godbey, seeks to show in the first paper that blood does not have the mystical or theological importance often attributed to it, and in the second paper he shows what is the ritual in which blood has a definite meaning and purpose.

S. A. B. M.

Bishop Rhinelander has just issued a clarion call to faith in his Convention Charge. A part of it has been published in printed form. Among other things he says "the kind of liberalism

which gives away the Church's faith, having little of its own, deserves a harsher name."

S. A. B. M.

In *Spiritual Healing and the Holy Communion* by the Rev. Canon Douglas, D.D., published by the Morehouse Publishing Company in Milwaukee, we have what I believe to be the most telling book, of its size, ever written on the subject of Spiritual Healing. Its forty-one pages are gripping in interest, and it sells for thirty-five cents.

S. A. B. M.

The ANGLICAN THEOLOGICAL REVIEW joins with scholars throughout the world in congratulating Professor Robertson, the great New Testament scholar, on the attainment of his sixtieth birthday and thirty-fifth year of New Testament teaching.

S. A. B. M.

A decree dated April 26, 1923, suppressed cannibalism in French Africa. It will be some time before it can be applied everywhere.

J. A. M.

The French Government has realized the danger of alcoholism in their West African colonies. They have effectively fought it by increased taxation. In 1920 more than 85,000 hectoliters were imported, in 1921 only 13,742, in 1922 only 6,660. This was a loss to the budget of the colony which in 1910 received 36 per cent. of its income from the alcohol tax and in 1923 only 8 per cent., but without sentimentality it was worth it.

J. A. M.

The world of Religious Education has suffered a serious loss in the death of Rev. Henry Frederick Cope, A.M., D.D. He had not been well for many months, and died on Aug. 3rd at his summer home at Little Point Sable, Shelby, Mich. He was the editor of "Religious Education" which is recognised as a necessity by every worker in the area with which it deals. Dr. Cope was born and educated in England, continuing his studies and ministerial work in the Southern Baptist Church in America,

and was later associated with Congregational churches. He was the author of sixteen books which have been of the greatest help to religious education instructors and organizations. Some of his later works are *Organizing the Church School* (Doran), *Week Day Religious Education* (Doran), *The Week Day Church School* (Doran), and *The Parent and the Child* (Doran).

S. A. B. M.

The first full session of the Commission appointed by the Archbishops of Canterbury and York "to consider the nature and grounds of Christian doctrine with a view to demonstrating the extent of existing agreement within the Church of England, and with a view to investigating how far it is possible to remove or diminish existing difficulties," was held at University College, Oxford, on September 10 and the four following days.

The Commission consists of the following members: Bishop of Oxford (Chairman), Bishop of Manchester, Archdeacon Darbyshire, Rev. F. R. Barry, Rev. H. B. Gooding, Rev. L. W. Grensted, Rev. W. L. Knox, Rev. W. R. Matthews, Professor W. Moberly, Rev. J. K. Mozley, Rev. O. C. Quick, Rev. A. E. J. Rawlinson, Rev. E. G. Selwyn, Rev. C. J. Shebbeare, Mr. Will Spens, Canon V. F. Storr, Canon B. H. Streeter, Professor A. E. Taylor, Rev. L. Thornton, Professor C. C. Webb, the Dean of Bristol, Prebendary E. J. Bicknell, and Canon H. A. Wilson.

S. A. B. M.

REVIEWS

Folk-lore in the Old Testament. By Sir James George Frazer, F.R.S., F.B.A.
Abridged Edition in One Volume. New York: Macmillan, 1923, pp. xxx,
476.

This book is an abridged edition in one volume of Sir J. G. Frazer's important work on *Folk-lore in the Old Testament* of which a critique appeared in this Review from the pen of Dr. H. H. Gowan shortly after its publication in 1918. The original edition in three portly volumes contains a wealth of illustration unnecessary for the ordinary reader. The author has therefore wisely acceded to a request for a shorter edition in which some chapters are omitted altogether, others abbreviated and the foot-notes containing references to authorities struck out. The result is a compact and intensely interesting discussion of the traces of folk-lore in the Old Testament.

The object of this work is to draw attention to the fact that the Hebrews, like all other peoples, passed through a stage of barbarism and even of savagery and that their literature contains many references to beliefs and practices which can only be explained on the supposition that they are survivals from a far lower level of culture. Many obscure passages in the Old Testament are illuminated by reference to the thought of earlier times and by analogies in the faith and practice of savage and semi-civilized races in the present day.

Although this work is mainly concerned with the traces of savagery and superstition in the Old Testament the author is not unmindful or inappreciative of the moral and spiritual heights to which Israel rose and devout readers of the Bible need not fear that a due consideration of these survivals of primitive thought and practice will obscure those qualities for which we reverence the Old Testament. "They rather serve as a foil to enhance by contrast the glory of a people which from such dark

depths of ignorance and cruelty could rise to such bright heights of wisdom and virtue."

We commend this important work in its new form to all who wish to understand more of the spiritual development of Israel.

F. H. COSGRAVE

Bible Selections arranged for Many Uses. By C. S. Buell and J. E. Wells. Chicago: Benj. H. Sanborn & Co., 1923, pp. 515.

Principal Buell and Professor Wells have herein made an extensive collection of the most notable passages of Biblical literature, which they have compiled to meet a great variety of uses, for example, Opening Exercises, Responsive Reading, Stories for the Home, Guidance for Private Reading, Daily Reading, etc. These passages have been printed in paragraph form, which renders the text attractive to the average reader. No attempt is made to displace the Bible, but it has been felt that a convenient collection of notable passages would create a desire for fuller acquaintance with the Bible. The book is highly to be commended for its convenience and for the excellent judgment shown in the selection of many of the finest passages in the Bible.

SAMUEL A. B. MERCER

Le Milieu Biblique avant Jésus-Christ. Volume I, Histoire et Civilisation. By Charles F. Jean. Paris: Paul Geuthner, 1922, pp. xxi, 339. 20 francs.

In the phrase *Milieu Biblique* the author includes the geographical environment, the ethnological background, and the moral, religious, and intellectual factors which have influenced the development of the Hebrew race. All would not express the matter quite so strongly as the present writer, but there is sufficient truth in the statement which we quote to make the study highly valuable. "Le peuple juif n'a pas de civilisation propre; négligeant ici les détails, nous pouvons affirmer que—à l'exception de sa Littérature sacrée,—il a tout reçu, copié ou imité. Ce fait est extrêmement important, on le sait" (p. vii). The present volume, beginning with the geological periods, treats of the historical environment from the earliest days to the Roman period. The

writer covers a wide field—wider than need be, perhaps—with a thorough knowledge, and with a style which makes the reading a pleasure. Obviously, there will be difference of opinion on many points, as, *e.g.*, the date of Sargon I—the author gives 3800 B.C.; the original language of the earlier part of Enoch—Aramaic, according to our author; but, on the whole, his statements are those which have been generally received. We have noted only one slip of the pen, p. 107 note, where it is said that the kingdom was offered to Samson (Judg. VIII, 22). The work concludes with a lengthy (pp. 209–339) and valuable series of tables and indices. The second volume, now in press, will deal with the literature, the third with the religious and moral ideas. The appearance of these will be awaited with interest, for the author has given us a thorough and substantial contribution to the subject.

F. H. HALLOCK

Studies in the Teaching of the Sermon on the Mount. By A. W. Robinson. New York: Doran, 1923, pp. 106. \$1.75 net.

The price of this little book is a great hindrance to its usefulness. The leading ideas of the Sermon on the Mount are clearly set forth in a way that ought to interest "adolescents," though the note on the saying on divorce and remarriage must be excepted: there is confusion of thought in the exegesis of that section. The book is one of the publications of the Student Christian Movement.

A. HAIRE FORSTER

New Testament Greek for Beginners. By J. Gresham Machen. New York: Macmillan, 1923, pp. xii + 285. \$2.20.

A Grammar constructed on the conventional lines with the "Classical" pronunciation. "The genitive case expresses possession," page 21. "The aorist is like the imperfect in that it refers to past time," page 85; even beginners might be shown more of the fascinating psychology of Greek cases and tenses than is shown them here.

A. HAIRE FORSTER

Problems of the New Testament To-day. By R. H. Malden. New York: Oxford University Press, American Branch, 1923, pp. 250. \$2.20.

A manual of New Testament introduction, written from a very conservative point of view by a writer who seems to have little equipment for his task. His bibliography on pp. 13-14 is a curious jumble of irrelevant and relevant in about equal proportions, symptomatic of which is the juxtaposition of Philostratus, Queen Victoria's Letters (listed under Q), and Ramsay, with no dates given for anything and with no indication of the editions used. The content of the volume is in accord with the introductory bibliography, some things fairly well said mixed with others that contain no particular point, mingled with considerable abuse of the "critics" and an undue amount of vociferous apologetic.

BURTON SCOTT EASTON

The Minister and His Greek New Testament. By A. T. Robertson. New York: Doran, 1923, pp. 139. \$1.75.

Dr. Robertson has given us in this volume a collection of essays and papers which can not be read by minister or theological student without awakening, or re-awakening, the desire to know, and to know better, the Greek New Testament. His exhortation is delivered with persuasive charm; his illustrations of the value of such study are lucid and cogent. The papers upon the prepositions, the negative, the Greek Article, and the Deity of Christ, etc., are valuable supplements to the author's monumental *Grammar of the Greek New Testament in the Light of Historical Research*, now in its fourth edition. Charles' *Grammar of the Apocalypse* (in the Introduction to his recent commentary) is severely criticized: "The phenomena are not to be explained by a single dictum. They are complex as life is and call for still further patient research."

FREDERICK C. GRANT

Introduction au Nouveau Testament. Les Evangiles Synoptiques. By M. Goguel. Paris, Leroux, 1923, pp. 532. Frs. 20.

Last year Professor Goguel gave us an epoch-making study of the book of the Acts of the Apostles, as the third volume of his In-

roduction to the New Testament. The book will be complete in five volumes. Like preceding books of Dr. Goguel, this volume is based on a thorough study of the sources and an intensive knowledge of the literature. In spite of this remarkable scientific preparation it is remarkably clear and written in a limpid style. He takes up successively the study of the term Gospel, the history of the synoptic problem, the testimony of tradition, the contents of the Gospel, the priority of Mark, the Logia, and then taking separately the Gospels of Mark, Matthew, and Luke, examines the traditional view, the plan and character, the sources, the style, the theological concepts, the date and the place of composition. In a book of this kind we do not expect new dazzling theories, but a sober, honest, fair statement of the point of view generally taken by scholars. This has been done by Professor Goguel in a masterly manner.

JOHN A. MAYNARD

Toward the Understanding of Jesus. By Vladimir G. Simkhovitch. New York: Macmillan, 1921, pp. vi + 83. 75 cents.

The present volume is a reprint of the title essay in a volume of historical studies issued in 1921. Professor Simkhovitch has undertaken to read afresh the life and teaching of our Lord in the light of the political situation in the first century. He interprets the Messianic hope as springing from "desperate political conditions no longer to be borne." He holds that our Lord's "simple call for a spiritual revival was offensive to the prevailing political sentiment, as well as to organized religion. The inevitable situation developed." On the other hand, Christ was no revolutionist or fanatic. "To me personally it seems childish not to see in Christ's teachings an overwhelming intellectual system. The towering parts that are its components are parts of the same system, not independent units. The truth of the insight, the cohesion of the system, were self-evident to Christ; so much so that he knew that they had an absolute quality; that is, coming from God. Because of the systematic nature of the insight, the conclusions drawn were inevitable and mandatory."

One can but feel a sincere admiration for the method of our author's investigation and grateful to him for making clear the significance of a somewhat neglected area in the background of our Lord's life. At the same time, there remains to be made a deeper study of the total economic, political, and social situation in Palestine in the first century, and especially in the first third of that century. It is to be hoped that Dr. Simkhovitch will continue to turn his talents in this direction.

FREDERICK C. GRANT

A Source Book for the Study of the Teaching of Jesus in Its Historical Relationships. By Earnest DeWitt Burton. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1923, pp. x + 277. \$2.00.

This volume will doubtless prove a very useful compendium of parallels to the sayings of our Lord found in the contemporary Jewish literature. It will be chiefly valuable, however, to those who already possess a first-hand acquaintance with that literature. One can but wish that the volume contained an Index, and an Index of Texts; and that a better typographical arrangement had been used—for example, spaces between the chapters, and black-face headings. The text is the English RV modernized. A mechanical scheme of chapter-divisions is followed and headings are set up even when nothing follows (*e.g.*, p. 174). The "Method of Study" (p. 14) is suggestive. All in all, this is a very useful text-book, if not exhaustive; it helps to make available the treasures stored in the old Jewish literature for the interpretation of the New Testament. The student ought to know this literature as a whole, and individual works as wholes; and this can easily be done, using either Charles' great *Corpus* or the single volumes now appearing in England. The present work with its quotations and bibliographies will whet the student's appetite for more.

FREDERICK C. GRANT

The Bible for School and Home. Vol. V, The Gospel Story, Part 1, From the Nativity to the Close of the Galilean Ministry; Vol. VI, Part 2, From the Close of the Galilean Ministry to the Ascension. By J. Paterson Smyth. New York: Doran, 1923, pp. 168 and 181. Each, \$1.25.

These volumes are distinctly "popular" in aim. Their author's point of view is familiar to all who know his "People's Life of Christ." The style and method are fairly illustrated by the following (V, p. 65):

"Don't be afraid, from henceforth thou shalt catch men." Meaning of this? Yes. That was what our Lord was out for. Catching men and women and children into his lovely Kingdom of God to make them holy and happy and helpful to the world and then at death to move them to a higher Kingdom.

The presuppositions are not critical.

FREDERICK C. GRANT

The Revelation of John. The Hartley Lecture for 1919. By A. S. Peake. New York: Doran, pp. xiv + 390. \$2.50 net.

The problems of the Apocalypse are treated in these lectures with Dr. Peake's judicious caution. He summarises the results of his investigation as follows: "In its present form the Apocalypse of John dates from the reign of Domitian, having been issued possibly about the year A.D. 93. In a sense we may speak of it as a unity; in other words it is the work of an author and not of a mere compiler. Yet it incorporates a good deal of earlier matter, some of it not later than the destruction of Jerusalem, and some of it non-Christian in its character. It reflects different historical situations and various points of view. But the book in its present form, and the earlier sections which have been embodied in it, were strictly relevant to the time when they originated and were called forth by the urgent necessities of the readers. In its final form the book is designed to steady the Churches against the terrible persecution which the fanaticism of the authorities set in motion against those who refused to worship the Roman Emperor."

While discussing the possibility of John Mark as the author he says "We have no evidence to connect Mark with the Province of Asia," but Col. 4: 10 and 2 Tim. 4: 11 are at least *some*

evidence for doing so. The second part is an exposition of each section of the Apocalypse and the final chapter is on the permanent value of the book.

A. HAIRE FORSTER

The Christian Church in the Epistles of St. Jerome. By L. Hughes. London: S. P. C. K. (N. Y., Macmillan), 1893, pp. viii, 116.

The author gives, on the whole, an excellent account of the subject suggested by the title of his little book. We would express in particular our appreciation of ch. 2, treating of the debt Biblical learning owes St. Jerome, and of the good summary of Origenism, pp. 79-86. Due allowance is made throughout for the characteristic temper and exaggeration of St. Jerome. The work is popular in character, and for this reason we regret that the author has not translated all of the Latin; also that any discussion of St. Jerome's statement as to the election of the patriarch of the Alexandrian Church has been introduced, as space is lacking to give the subject the treatment which it requires if the ordinary reader is not to be misled. The account of asceticism and monasticism is rather unsympathetic. Apart from these defects, from our point of view, the book is wholly to be commended as an introduction to an interesting and comparatively little known subject.

F. H. HALLOCK

Roman Home Life and Religion. By H. L. Rogers and T. R. Harley. N. Y.: Oxford University Press, 1923, pp. xiii, 243. \$2.00.

When our teachers of Latin become bold enough to break with tradition and use such books as the present a great advance will have been made in imparting an appreciation of the treasures contained in Latin literature, and the painfully acquired knowledge will not be forgotten by the average student as soon as the final examinations are passed. The more important sides of home life and religion are treated under ten heads. Each section and each quotation is introduced by a brief note sufficient to supply a context. About half of the matter is in the original and

about half in translation. The authors used are of various dates, St. Augustine being the latest and, with the exception of one passage from the Vulgate, the only Christian. As a text-book it could hardly be used in America before the sophomore college year after five years' preparation; but it should have a much wider use than that of a text-book, for the adult reader will find in it much of value and interest as well as an opportunity of brushing up his knowledge of Latin. The editors have shown much skill in choosing quotations.

F. H. HALLOCK

Modernism and the Person of Christ. By W. J. Sparrow Simpson. Milwaukee: Morehouse Pub. Co., 1923, pp. 104. \$2.00.

In the present work the author has expanded the chapters on Christology contained in his *Broad Church Theology*.

He notes the difficulty in defining Modernism; it is a "tendency," "distinctly individual" (p. 7). Largely an importation from Germany and France, he finds the "clearest and ablest exposition" in England that given at the Girton Conference in 1921 (p. 8). It is a conglomeration of views, united only in opposition to traditional orthodoxy. When it retains traditional language it uses it in a non-traditional sense, with the avowed intent of making faith easier by restatement, but it results in a revision which changes the essentials of faith. "Unitarianism can never be a restatement of the Trinitarian Christianity" (p. 20). It sets forth a human Christ who may be spoken of as Divine only in a figurative sense. Regarding orthodoxy as tri-theistic it often reacts to pantheism. Presuppositions appear on both sides: "We may be unduly influenced by an inherited view. But so may we by the latest phase of human thought" (pp. 15-16). "There is a very significant tendency in Modernism to throw discredit at once on any passage which suggests or implies a supernatural claim on the part of Christ" (p. 63). Its line of thought appears to be "that there is not a vast gulf between the Divine Nature and the Human Nature" (p. 89); a line of thought which has appeared recently in Dr. Drown's *The Creative Christ*,

we may note. An examination of the texts in which Christ calls upon men to answer questions as to His Nature forces us back to the old dilemma *Christus aut deus aut homo non bonus*, unless we evade the issue and resort to the explanation suggested in St. John X:20. To interpret His self-consciousness aright requires more than critical ability or psychological training; "It really requires above all things else a spiritual insight, which is a very hard thing for any among us to possess. And precisely because such spiritual insight is comparatively rare, we set more value on the original exponents of Christ. For no man, whatever his religion may be, can well deny that S. Paul and the Fourth Evangelist were spiritual experts, unsurpassed in the annals of religious experience" (pp. 37-38). The following chapters show admirably the real shallowness of the pseudo learning of the Modernists and the antiquated nature of the method they pursue, for it is based upon a picking and choosing process applied to Scriptural texts with eyes blind to the context; that is, their method is the generally abandoned proof-text method. The earlier part of ch. V gives a splendid résumé of the Christology of the Church; but in the later part a sympathy with Kenotic views appears. At this point we think Dr. Bethune-Baker has given a truer interpretation of the work of Dr. Bruce, *The Humiliation of Christ*, for even the quotations from the latter work here given make it evident that Dr. Bruce did not regard Kenoticism as an open question. The last chapter deals with the views of Drs. Loof and Seeberg.

The author has given us a fine refutation of Modernism as it touches the Person of Christ and furnished a book which should be widely circulated. We regret that the price is so disproportionately high, even in these days of high costs no other work of similar size, less than a hundred small pages of text, has been priced at such a figure.

F. H. HALLOCK

What is Mysticism?—"A Study of Man's Search for God." By the Rev. Charles Morris Addison, D.D. Macmillan, 1923.

A thin little volume of fifty-four pages, easily readable in half an hour, and valuable only as a very simple and elementary introduction to the study of mysticism.

Business Methods for the Clergy. By the Rev. Marshall M. Day, B.D. A Manual for the Desk. Morehouse Publishing Co., 1923.

This little book of forty-six pages is a clear definite practical guide to "the young clergyman bewildered by the double complication of his first household and his first parish"; older clergy should profit by it too. Organizing the Desk, Organizing the Day's Work, System in the Desk, First Aid to Memory, The Card Index, Little Schemes for Saving Time, The Clergyman as Executive—these are the chapter titles. It is what it sets out to be—a manual for the desk—and worth many times its purchase price.

The Poems of a Salvationist. By E. Irena Arnold (Mrs. Brigadier William C. Arnold), with a foreword by Evangeline Booth. Fleming H. Revell, 1923.

This is not a companion volume for Christina Rossetti's Verse. Neither does it suggest Keble and the Christian Year. Every page resounds with

A big voiced lassie making banjoes twang
As tranced fanatical she shrieked and sang
"Are you washed in the blood of the Lamb?"

This book is pious jing-jing jangles on a tambourine; Edgar Guest in an army uniform; poet's corner *pomes* from a small town weekly; sob-stuff, and cheer-stuff, and hip-hip-hurray stuff; the theology of Billy Sunday set swinging to the corybantic rhythms of Nicholas Vachel Lindsay.

GEORGE CRAIG STEWART

Tutankhamen and Egyptology. By the Very Rev. S. A. B. Mercer, D.D. Milwaukee: Morehouse, 1923, pp. xi, 100. \$1.50.

Dr. Mercer has taken advantage of the present interest in Egyptology and given us a masterly summary of the subject in

general; his little book will serve to quicken this interest in all who may read it. The well-chosen bibliography will supply a guide book to more extended reading.

He first gives the history of the discovery of the tomb of Tutankhamen and a description of the articles found therein. He notes that the find has been rather of a spectacular nature and that it has added little to our knowledge of Egypt (p. 14). After a fine résumé of the history of Egypt to the end of the Eighteenth Dynasty, he translates the comparatively few inscriptions relative to Tutankhamen. He has not given us a translation of the name of this Pharaoh, but in the foot-piece at the end of chap. 3 there is a good representation of the *ankh* symbol, third figure from the left, which was to become the Egyptian cross in later days. Chap. 4, Tutankhamen and the Bible, contains more information than is to be found in the entirety of some recent volumes. In the present state of knowledge—and surmise—no two scholars will agree as to all the theories put forth. Perhaps most objection will be urged against Dr. Mercer's view that *all* the Hebrews were in Egypt; the chief difficulty of his theory of the various exoduses appears in his leaving the strongest and most aggressive tribes in Egypt until the last. As to the religion, he avoids much of the twaddle that has been written about Ikhnaton's "monotheism," and says "The Egyptians never succeeded in establishing a monotheistic conception of God" (p. 79). A glossary of technical terms (pp. 80-87) will be found invaluable by the general reader. A chronological table carries the history down to the Greek period.

Of the flood of books occasioned by the finding of Tutankhamen's tomb we have seen none which compacts so much information in so readable a form.

F. H. HALLOCK

Western Mysticism. By Dom Cuthbert Butler. New York: Dutton, 1922, pp. xiii, 344. \$5.00.

Dom Butler's theme, limited by the term "Western," is not all that has been known as Mysticism in Western Christendom,

but "the native mysticism of the West that prevailed in Western Europe during the six centuries from St. Benedict to St. Bernard; and has characteristics of its own, marking it off from later kinds, and still rendering it peculiarly appropriate for Westerns."

There is, as the author notes at the outset, "probably no more misused word in these our days than 'mysticism.' It has come to be applied to many things of many kinds: to theosophy and Christian science; to spiritualism and clairvoyance; to demonology and witchcraft; to occultism and magic; to weird psychical experiences, if only they have some religious colour; to revelations and visions; to other-worldliness, or even mere dreaminess and impracticability in the affairs of life; to poetry and painting and music of which the motif is unobvious and vague. It has been identified with the attitude of the religious mind that cares not for dogma or doctrine, for church or sacraments; it has been identified also with a certain outlook on the world—a seeing God in nature, and recognizing that the material creation in various ways symbolizes spiritual realities; a beautiful and true conception, and one that was dear to St. Francis of Assisi, but which is not mysticism according to its historical meaning. And on the other side, the meaning of the term has been watered down: it has been said that the love of God is mysticism; or that mysticism is only the Christian life lived on a high level; or that it is Roman Catholic piety in extreme form. Against all this stands the perfectly clear traditional historical meaning, handed down in the Christian Church throughout the centuries, not subject to confusion of thought until recent times." While he makes use of the word "mysticism" in the title of his book on the subject, and frequently in the text, Dom Butler reminds his readers that it is "quite a modern word," and that "contemplation" is the term used in the Latin Church to designate "the mystical experience."

For an answer to the question, What is Mysticism, or Contemplation?, Dom Butler would have us take what the Christian Mystics themselves thought it to be, viz., "the experimental per-

ception of God's Presence and Being, and especially 'union with God'—a union, that is, not merely psychological, in conforming the will to God's Will, but, it may be said, ontological of the soul with God, spirit with spirit."

Dom Butler admits that "there are phases and stages of mysticism which fall short of the supreme experiences," but he implies that mysticism in its fulness and essential nature must include such experiences.

We like better the answer given by one of our own Communion, viz., the Abbot of Pershore, to the same question. "Fundamentally and according to the history of the term 'Contemplation' in the Church, East and West, Contemplation means no more than letting the soul and mind, or the whole personality or self, REST upon the great truths of Religion, whether we have arrived at these truths by argument, investigation, discursive meditation or not, though for better or worse it is probably true that men's religious beliefs do, in fact, repose on intuitive affirmations. Contemplation, then, is simply one aspect of a devotional or spiritual life that is earnestly and intensely lived, and it inheres in the very idea of religion, prayer, and love." "Moreover," the said Abbot does not hesitate to declare, "there is an English mysticism with a *cachet*, an aroma, a character of its own—in line with the true tradition and main historical prayer-experience of the Church, East and West."

Extracts, short and long, from the writings of St. Augustine, St. Gregory, and St. Bernard, set forth in orderly sequence, and containing the said Father's mystical teaching and their own description of what they believed took place when they were in the mystical state, make up the larger part of Dom Butler's book. A few passages from the writings of Western mystics later than St. Bernard are quoted in the Prologue, and the witness of such authors is not infrequently referred to throughout the book. Introducing, connecting, and summarizing all that he quotes are the author's own illuminating and edifying comments.

For Dom Butler, St. Augustine is "the Prince of Mystics"

uniting in himself "the most penetrating intellectual vision into things divine, and a love of God that was a consuming passion." Our author notes, at some length, that "St. Augustine is in himself the refutation of a number of popular misconceptions about mysticism and mystics." Against "the notion that mysticism is a reaction and protest against ecclesiasticism, sacramental system, dogma, church authority, and institutional religion," is set the fact that St. Augustine was "preëminently a churchman, nay a militant one, a subtle theologian, and an almost fierce dogmatist." That mysticism "represents an antagonism between personal religion and a religion of authority" has its refutation in Augustine, in whom "the three elements of well-balanced religion, the personal, the institutional, and the intellectual, are triumphantly conciliated." Nor is the theory true that "vacancy from external works and occupations is a condition of contemplation and that mystics are impracticable dreamers"; for Augustine "was full of business, a bishop devoted to his flock, a popular preacher, and a letter-writer ever ready to answer, even at great length, the questions put to him."

It seems highly probable that priests who may be fairly familiar with patristic writings will be surprised to find, as they read Dom Butler's pages, how much they themselves missed in their own former reading of the passages cited by the author. And all, whosoever they may be, whether clerical or lay persons, that read this book, must in some degree be impressed with its spirituality, breathe in the reading thereof an atmosphere from which all controversial bitterness has been banished, be conscious of hallowing influences in well nigh every page, and be led onwards to more intimate relations with the one true God. The entire volume has indeed extraordinary spiritual value; and, as is noted in the Preface, there is contained therein, especially in the section on St. Gregory which deals with the subject of the contemplative and active lives, "a body of doctrines at once elevated, sane, and practical, that must prove most helpful to the pastoral clergy and to all priests for the regulating of their lives."

C. P. A. BURNETT

Des hl. Basilii d. Gr. Geistliche Uebungen auf der Bischofskonferenz von Dazimon 374-5 im Anschluss an Isaia 1-16. By Dr. Joseph Wittig, o. ö. Professor an der Universität Breslau. Breslau: G. P. Aderholz, 1922, pp. viii-90.

Under the title *Breslauer Studien zur historischen Theologie* the *Kirchengeschichten Abhandlungen*, begun by Dr. Max Sdralek in 1902 and ended in 1921, are to be continued in a new series and different form. Dr. Wittig's monograph constitutes the first number of this new series, and augurs well for its promise of accurate scholarship and spiritual insight. The task with which the author has been occupied is the problem of the authorship of a Commentary on Isaiah 1-16, the attribution of which to St. Basil has been generally given up by modern scholars, and a critical investigation of its provenance, circumstances, purpose, and history. Beginning with the obscure sentences which preface the Commentary, the author offers an ingenious and rather convincing exegesis of the passages in the light of the other parts of the work. Then he examines both style and content of the Commentary in relation to *Epist.* 210, 6, the other letters to Neo-Cæsarea, and the Hexæmeron of St. Basil (pp. 5-8), and, in conjunction with the facts bearing on the Synod of Bishops held at Dazimon in 374-5 (pp. 8-36), concludes that "The whole Commentary comprises addresses given to bishops. . . . Even though *some* of these addresses have no discernible relation to the Synod of Dazimon or the preparatory and contemporary letters of Basil, yet the *whole* Commentary must be brought into relation with the Synod. . . . It still remains possible, however, that alien elements have been introduced" (p. 36). This thesis seems abundantly confirmed by the indirect evidence the author adduces: the internal evidence reflecting contemporary conditions and opinion (cf. pp. 36-40), the composition and style of the document as compared with certainly genuine writings of the Saint and with his known exegetical works and method (pp. 41-57). The two last sections (9 and 10) bring contentions to bear the weight of which alone would almost establish the case advanced (pp. 57-89). In con-

junction with the whole nexus of Dr. Wittig's argument, the accumulated mass of fact and interpretation would seem satisfactorily to demonstrate the high probability of his thesis that this commentary is really the work of S. Basil.

F. GAVIN

Der hl. Dominikus: Untersuchungen und Texte. By Dr. Berthold Althamer, Privatdozent an der Universität Breslau. Breslau: G. P. Aderholz' Buchhandlung, 1922, pp. xviii + 265.

This, the second volume in the *Breslauer Studien zur historischen Theologie*, bears evidence of the originality, exhaustiveness, care, and scholarly acumen which characterize the best work of present-day German historical science. The results of the meticulous and searching investigations of the author clear the ground for the long-needed scientific study of the life of St. Dominic. "Any one who has followed the recent literature investigating the cultural and monastic history of the thirteenth century is aware how largely the Poverello of Assisi bulks in the foreground of public interest. An international circle of scholars has brought enormous labor and unsparing acumen to bear upon the many literary, critical, and historical problems concerned, with great success. There is no question that Francis of Assisi is a more original and richer personality than his friend and rival of Spain, but this does not explain the disproportion between the flood of scientific studies concerned with the origins of the Franciscan movement, and the strictly scientific literature which deals with the person of the founder of the Spanish order. It is both recognized and regretted that to date no biography of St. Dominic has appeared which does justice to the scientific demands of the case" (*Preface*, p. x). Dr. Althamer has for years interested himself in research bearing on the founder of the Order of Preachers, and here gives us the results of his labor. One of the first problems that presents itself is the fact that "while we have a few fragments written by St. Francis, the earnest opponent of books and science, we possess practically nothing from St. Dominic, who was a thoroughgoing theo-

logian" (pp. 207-208). We are driven then to consult secondary sources for the facts and interpretation of his life. The first section of Dr. Althamer's work is given over to the examination of nineteen documents of varying value, which offer us the materials for St. Dominic's biography. Beginning with Jordan of Saxony (General of the O. P., 1222-1237) and concluding with John Colonna (*circa* 1340), the author reviews, criticises, and estimates the data available of which presentation the following summary is typical. After offering the external evidence for the text of the *Libellus de initio ordinis prædicatorum* and thereby ascertaining its date (pp. 3-5), Dr. Althamer investigates the question of the date of writing. The extreme limits of the period of composition are *paucis annis post obitum s. Dominici* (1221) and 1234 the date of his canonization. As mention is made of the introduction of the *Salve Regina* into the Office Dominican, which occurred in 1224-1226, of the death of Bp. Fulko of Toulouse († 1231), and of Peter Cellani as Prior of Limoges, who became, by papal appointment, Inquisitor in the prosecution of the Albigenses in 1233, the limits of the date are narrowed down to the years 1232-1233. By internal examination of the data it may be demonstrated that the *Libellus* antedates the Encyclical on the translation of St. Dominic (1234), and the author concludes that the *Libellus* was written between January and April of 1233, in upper Italy, with a definite purpose of preparing the way for the process of canonization (pp. 6-11). Most interesting and scrupulous is Dr. Althamer's searching examination of the sources employed by Jordan (pp. 12-19), for he dissolves Jordan's words (*existens in ordine satis vidi familiariter que cognovi*), by a most acute and penetrating investigation of the facts dealing with all the possible relations between Dominic and him, into a veritable exaggeration and literary fiction. In short, the "poverty of historical and legendary details confirms the . . . opinion that Jordan wrote without availing himself of the sources at his disposal . . ." under the exigency of the demands of his purpose: the hoped-for and imminent canonization of St. Dominic (p. 19).

The second part (pp. 201-208) deals with three related questions, which have aroused the author's interest: Was St. Dominic the first *Magister sacri palatii*? What literary remains have we of the Saint? What are the facts regarding the Translation and Canonization of St. Dominic? In every case, brief as his treatment is, the author commends himself as eminently satisfactory and convincing. The second part (pp. 229-258) contains critical editions of three important texts not hitherto carefully edited—Bartholomew Tridentinus, Stephen of Salanhaco, and Conrad of Trebensee. An index concludes the volume

F. GAVIN

Icelandic Meditations on the Passion: Selections from the Passion-Hymns of Hallgrim Petursson, translated from the Icelandic and arranged as a series of Meditations for each day of the month by Charles Venn Pilcher, D.D., Professor of Old Testament Literature at Wycliffe College, Toronto.

Dr. Pilcher has rendered a distinct service in introducing us to the life and work of Hallgrim Petursson, the leper poet of Iceland, quite apart from his translation of the Passion-Hymns. It is a strange story, that of the bell-ringer's son of Holar, born in Iceland over three centuries ago, educated in Copenhagen, appointed teacher to the ransomed victims of an Algerian pirate-raid, himself the captive of a woman's wiles which led him back to his native land, then penitent and priest, poet and leper, till, after seven years' struggle with the fell disease, he passed away, still singing, in 1674.

To have raised over Iceland "a mighty crucifix of song," towards which the eyes of his countrymen might be turned for consolation and healing generation after generation, was a great achievement, and now the achievement has been both broadened and heightened by Dr. Pilcher's labor of love in the rendering of the Passion-Hymns into English. They are, moreover, translated without alteration of the rhyming-scheme or metre, so that the old Icelandic tunes may still be used.

That the Hymns should attain in another land and in another tongue the popularity which made them the Lenten songs of the

Icelandic farm-hands is not to be expected. The poems, even in their original language, have the limitations of their time and of the particular type of Christianity which Hallgrim favored. The soteriology of the hymns is of a prevalently forensic character and the "blood of Christ" is too evidently thought of as a refuge from the wrath of God. But beyond whatever devotional expressions may jar upon us to-day one discerns the beating of a human heart which finds in every incident of the Sacred Passion a directly personal appeal for repentance and for love. If Peter, following to the Judgment Hall, denies his Master, Hallgrim himself must make expiation for the failure:

The way is long, I find
My weak steps falling;
O turn, to my dark mind
Thy grace recalling.

If he dwells upon the sin of the soldiers who crucified the Christ, it is because

My face, my face, dear Lord, I see
With guilty consternation,
Among the soldiers wounding Thee—
My sin's dread expiation.

So it is, on through all the Passion story, till the Burial of Christ prompts the thought (strikingly similar to that of one of our own most beautiful hymns):

Hew out within this stony heart
A room where Christ may rest apart;
And then, Spirit Divine, prepare
Faith's linen fair,
Contrition's spicy ointments rare.

It would be too much to claim that Hallgrim Petursson was a great poet, but he was plainly a very sincere one. His "crucifix of song" may well, as made available for us by the loving labor of the translator, and as divided up into these daily portions, be used to stimulate the devotions of Christian people to-day. Could this old Icelandic priest have desired a better fate for the fruit of his own Passion?

HERBERT H. GOWEN

The Evolution and Progress of Mankind. By Hermann Klaatsch. Edited and Enlarged by Adolph Heilborn, Translated by Joseph McCabe. New York: Stokes, 1923, pp. 316, ill. \$8.50.

According to Professor Erskine of Columbia, the professional scientist does not go to church to hear a second-rate discussion of science from the pulpit. Nor does anyone else go for this reason, very probably! However, the fact does not release clergymen and students of theology from the obligation of making the acquaintance of modern scientific works—particularly those which are positive in aim, general in scope, and non-technical in language. Every one reads science, nowadays. Even the newspapers have scientific pages or columns. Thompson's "Outline" is in every book-shop window. The preacher, teacher, or student who would know what other men are thinking and make an intelligent presentation of religion to his contemporaries must know some science. Even the "Fundamentalists"—perhaps more than others—should study modern science.

Aside from his work of popularizing, at which he was very successful, and considerable research archæology in Europe and Australia, Klaatsch's chief contribution to modern Anthropology is the theory of *polygenesis*. On his interpretation, the evidence points not to a single but to a multiple origin of the human race; to more than one point of emergence of *genus homo* from the lower orders. The Aurignac man, he holds, came to Europe from Asia, the Neanderthal from Africa; and the former is closely allied in structure to the orang, the latter to the gorilla. To account for these phenomena he assumed an early division of the higher Primates into two great branches, an eastern and a western, each of these divisions being represented by races of men and anthropoid apes. He left aside the question of whether other varieties of the race might not stand in the same relation to the chimpanzee and gibbon as the elder races stood to the gorilla and orang. In the present volume, while not receding from this position, it is not stressed.

That all have a common ultimate origin cannot be questioned—but

it is very remote—as remote as the separation of the apes and man. We can say very little in the present state of science about the home of the common ancestor. The distribution of the living forms, however, clearly points to some region which must have had connections with both Africa, Australia, and Asia. There is a good deal to be said, especially as regards the eastern group, for the Malay Archipelago. When we remember the difficulty of expansion, the actual region of the orang and gibbon is significant. The grouping of the whole of the anthropoid apes and the races of men round the district of the Indian Ocean suggests that a continent on which the primitive ape-men lived has foundered in that region; indeed Dr. Russel Wallace showed decades ago that there were clear traces of such a lost continent, and the idea is generally received, though it is disputed if this was the cradle of the race (p. 107).

The aim of the work is to present in broad outline the story of man's rise and development. The chapter on the beginnings of religion is concerned with the *very* beginnings—at the stage of transition from pre-human to human; and will be of interest to the psychologist of religion, as well, who finds vestiges of these earliest attitudes cropping out of the subconscious in civilized man.

Gradually, step by step, science is advancing to recover the buried past of mankind. There are those who hold that to know origins is equivalent to understanding the nature, purpose, and meaning of a process. Man's significance as a spiritual being vanishes in the light of his evolutionary beginnings. It is for a valid theology, as for valid philosophy and valid science, to deny this; not to deny the facts of origins, but to assert once more, as Aristotle affirmed, that the meaning of a process is to be discerned in its end, not its beginnings. To which agree the Apostles: "That was not first which is spiritual, but that which is natural; and afterward that which is spiritual." "Now are we the sons of God, and it doth not yet appear what we shall be."

FREDERICK C. GRANT

Hindu Ethics. By John McKenzie. New York: Oxford University Press, American Branch, 1922, pp. 279. \$4.50.

This volume belongs to the *Religious Quest of India* series edited by J. N. Farquhar and H. D. Griswold, and is worthy of

its predecessors. It was not an easy book to write because the material to be studied was tremendously large, and the ethical value of it was often so incidental that Dr. McKenzie's mind must have been constantly on the alert. He takes up under the heading of early ethics, the ethics of the Rigveda, the ethics of Magic and sacrifice (a very thorough discussion of the Atharva Veda, and the conception of sin as a fluid) and the notion of Dharma. The second book covers the ethics of the philosophies and theologies, including an excellent study of the ethics of the Gita and of Bhakti. There is a fine chapter on modern Hindu ethical tendencies. The third book examines the weightier elements of Hindu ethics, karma, transmigration, asceticism and the positive contribution of 'Hinduism' to ethical thought. This chapter is continued by an estimate of Hindu and Christian ethic, which is really very fair. We envy India her missionaries and that splendid spirit which inspires the *Religious Quest of India* and the *Heritage of India* series. We wish other mission fields had seers of the same value and could teach us so much. For we at home need books like these for our own enlightenment, for a better understanding of the true missionary spirit, for a deeper conception of the external, universal and everlasting Christ. Incidentally we need such books to counterbalance the propaganda made among us by Americanized Hindu cults. These are more widespread than we usually imagine. The best way to check them is to tell the truth about India even if it shocks for a while those whose missionary zeal is tied to an unfair, pathetic and somewhat Pharisaic sentimentalism about the benighted heathen, steeped in idolatry, ignominy, and ignorance. Truth will prevail.

JOHN A. MAYNARD

Christianity and Social Science. By Charles A. Ellwood. New York: Macmillan, 1923, pp. 220.

People are saying on every hand that with the help of science civilization has made tremendous material advance in the last hundred years, but that now, to save civilization from itself, we

must strive for spiritual progress. This sentiment has become a commonplace. To most this implies a turning away from science to art or religion, or some other activity supposed to be spiritual. But those are nearer the truth who insist that science can be an ally of progress spiritual as well as of progress material. These rightly turn to science to help get the world out of the situation it has gotten itself into.

This is the position that Professor Ellwood takes. Christianity must supply the motive force, but science, in the shape of "social science" must supply the direction, for the redemption of mankind. He quotes Professor Ward as saying "the future of mankind depends upon religion becoming scientific and therefore social, it equally depends upon science becoming social and therefore religious." The sociological background of the book is in the first chapters. It is a clear and readable restatement of some important principles familiar to sociology. Primitive man had two attitudes toward other people: he fought those outside his immediate group, and helped those that were inside. All our attitudes to-day can be traced back to one or other of these "pattern ideas." Judaism and later on Christianity represent attempts to make family affection the "type and pattern of all relations between man and between God and men." The main part of the book is an elaboration of this thesis. There are chapters on Socialization, Service, Love, and Reconciliation, which say little more than that these are good things and that we ought to have more of them. There are few illustrations and there is little concrete material. One finishes these chapters with the feeling that it would have been possible to say in a page what is spread out to cover a hundred or more pages. The last two chapters are the best in the book: an earnest plea for more intelligent social emphasis in religious education, and an earnest plea for more intelligent and consecrated leadership on the part of both clergy and laity.

The great defect is the author's inadequate view of religion. Ellwood, the theologian receives such complete and enthusiastic

approval from Ellwood the sociologist, that one is suspicious of collusion. For him Christianity means the Fatherhood of God and the brotherhood of man, with the emphasis on the brotherhood. Jesus Christ is not God, the Church is a voluntary association. He speaks often about the Church, but he means the churches. He has no conception of the church as a divinely ordained institution, transforming society from within by ministry and sacraments. So he leaves out entirely one of the points where religion and sociology touch most significantly. His Christianity is simply sociology with a religious motive.

The book is interesting, however, as an example of the way social science and religion are coming together. It will repay reading on the part of anyone who wants to know more about this partnership.

CHARLES L. STREET

Christianity and Liberalism. By J. G. Machen. New York: Macmillan, 1923, pp. 189. \$1.75.

Much in this volume will be generally acceptable to churchmen. However, its spirit and attitude are not altogether promising. For example, the following statement appears at the book's beginning: "In the sphere of religion, as in other spheres, the things about which men are agreed are apt to be the things that are less worth holding; the really important things are the things about which men will fight." Dr. Machen is prepared to fight all comers who hold a "historical" or "developmental" conception of the Christian religion, and to "liberalism" he is willing to surrender everything, apparently, that is not comprised by a literal interpretation of the Old and New Testaments.

"The real authority, for liberalism, can only be 'the Christian consciousness' or 'Christian experience'; but how shall the findings of the Christian consciousness be established? Surely not by a majority vote of the organized church. Such a method would obviously do away with all liberty of conscience. The only authority, then, can be individual experience. . . . Such an authority is obviously no authority at all; for individual ex-

perience is entirely diverse and when once truth is regarded only as that which works at any particular time, it ceases to be truth. The result is an abysmal skepticism. The Christian man, on the other hand, finds in the Bible the very Word of God."

Such a reading of "liberalism" is, however, inapplicable to all but a radical left-wing minority. And if one's choice must be between the "authority of experience" and a literal Bible, there is no question where most modern Christians—at least within the Anglican Communion—stand. "Christian experience" is too precious to be sacrificed in this way.

FREDERICK C. GRANT

A Book of Prayers for Students. Third Edition, revised and enlarged. Pp. viii + 178. London: Student Christian Movement, 1921. 3/.

This very excellent little manual has now appeared in its third edition. As its title suggests, it is specially designed for the use of students, and contains (1) Short Services for a Week, (2) Litanies and Meditations, (3) General Prayers, (4) Collects and Short Prayers, and (5) Intercessions. The sources for the prayers range from the early eighteenth century to the present. One wishes a copy of this book might be placed upon the desk of every one of our students at college.

FREDERICK C. GRANT

Psychology and the Christian Life. By T. W. Pym. London: Student Christian Movement, 1922, pp. xii + 138. Cloth 4/; paper, 2/6. (New York: Doran.)

This is the fifth impression of an increasingly popular exposition of the New Psychology as it applies to the practice of Christianity. One wonders why more has not been done in the past to utilize the knowledge of psychology in the spiritual conduct of life, and one is grateful that there are men like Dr. Pym to take this step today, even when the present-day study of psychology seems farther than ever removed from the Christian theory. Nevertheless, great as has been the contribution of Freud, the new psychology is not solely his discovery. It is pos-

sible to interpret the activities of the human mind, conscious and subconscious, in terms not wholly those of sex. More and closer ties are being discovered between the modern study and treatment of human ills through the subconscious mind and the method of our Lord and his Apostles. A friend of the present reviewer insists that "the whole of the new psychology is to be found in the New Testament."

The chapters on "Faith and Suggestion" and "The Psychology of Sin" are especially valuable. One can but wish that every priest had it as part of his preparation to master—so far as mastery is possible today—the subject of this book; at least every clergyman should read it. It is not assumed that every parish priest is or may become an expert psycho-analyst. However, "ministers of religion should be able to prevent many individuals from ever reaching the state in which skilled medical attention is necessary. Some study of psychological medicine will enable them more quickly to recognize cases in which such professional help is required. At present some people who should be in the doctor's hands are being told by their clergy to 'say their prayers' or 'come to church.'"

FREDERICK C. GRANT

Miracles and the New Psychology: A Study in the Healing Miracles of the New Testament. By E. R. Micklem. New York: Oxford University Press, American Branch, 1922, pp. 143.

This volume represents a pioneer investigation in an important field destined to attract the interest of students for a long time to come. The similarity between the healing miracles of the New Testament and those of modern psychotherapy is quite obvious. Mr. Micklem is well equipped for his task. He is thoroughly well-read in the fields of New Testament criticism and modern psychiatry; moreover, he possesses a balanced judgment. "It is not my purpose," he writes, "to attempt to support the thesis that all the patients whom our Lord or his followers cured were suffering from maladies which were 'hysterical' or which were 'functional.'" He offers no offhand solutions, but believes

"that there are laws of the Universe which are still waiting to be discovered by painful research."

Chapter II offers a very good brief introduction to psychotherapy; Chapter III an introduction to sources—in which the modern critical view is assumed. Chapter IV discusses "beliefs current in New Testament times liable to affect diagnosis of diseases and methods of healing: (a) Relation between sin and suffering, (b) Belief in demons." The remaining chapters discuss the various classes of diseases healed, *e.g.*, leprosy, demon possession, fever, paralysis, blindness, etc., many of which are even today perfectly simulated hysterically and may be cured by suggestion.

What is the "evidential value of miracles" today? Would a method of scientific investigation, such as Micklem has followed, destroy that value?—Not unless we ignore the Source of *all* healing, spiritual or "material." Not unless that value is given an exaggerated meaning, one which, let us say, it did not possess for our Lord himself. Christ did not lay undue emphasis upon miracles. He admitted—nay, he anticipated—that others should perform them. Their meaning for him seems indicated clearly in such sayings as "If I, by the finger of God, cast out demons, then is the kingdom of God come upon you"; "Go tell John the things that ye see and hear. . . ." Modern psychotherapy is apparently rediscovering his method, in part. Let us hope that by this means modern medicine will rediscover or retain his spirit. Our Lord obeyed, and in obedience made use of, the laws of the Universe, even as God Himself "obeys" His own law. And the laws of the Universe are the laws of God.

FREDERICK C. GRANT

Tradition and Progress. By Gilbert Murray. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Co., 1922, pp. 221. \$3.00.

A volume by Gilbert Murray needs only to be announced to rouse in most educated minds an eager anticipation. The present volume is a collection of ten articles and addresses, partly literary, partly political, partly philosophical. The first one,

"Religio Grammatici: the religion of a 'Man of Letters,' " is an avowal of the idealism which inspires modern Hellenists, and a defense of the study of (ancient) letters.

To search the past is not to go into prison. It is to escape out of prison, because it compels us to compare the ways of our own age with other ways. . . . There are in life two elements, one the transitory and progressive, the other comparatively if not absolutely non-progressive and eternal, and the soul of man is chiefly concerned with the second. . . . The things of the spirit depend on will, on effort, on aspiration, on the quality of the individual soul; and not on discoveries and material advances which can be accumulated and added up.

Of especial interest to the theologian are "The Stoic Philosophy" (heretofore separately printed); "The Soul As It Is and How to Deal With It"; and "Satanism and the World Order." The last named is a study of the psychology underlying apocalyptic eschatology, and deserves careful study. For example:

These imperial cities [*e.g.*, Rome] mostly rose to empire not because of their faults, but because of their virtues; because they were strong and competent and trustworthy, and, within their borders and among their own people, were mostly models of effective justice. And we think of them as mere types of corruption! The hate they inspired among their subjects has so utterly swamped, in the memory of mankind, the benefits of their good government, or the contented and peaceful lives which they made possible to their own peoples. It is an awe-inspiring thought for us who now sit in their place.

Dr. Murray is not only Regius Professor of Greek at Oxford, but was a delegate to the Second Assembly of the League of Nations. What is his view of the future?—"I believe firmly that unless the World Order is affected by a change of heart, the World Order is doomed. Unless it abstains utterly from war the next great war will destroy it."

FREDERICK C. GRANT

Communism and Christianity. By Bishop W. M. Brown. The Bradford-Brown Educational Company, pp. 223.

The theme of this book is that there is no God and that Karl Marx is his prophet. "Banish Gods from Skies and Capitalists from Earth" is the slogan on the outside cover.

If an educated man is one who can weigh evidence and know when a thing is proved, this book shows that we need a campaign for a better educated Episcopate even though Euripides says that we should bear with the ignorances of those in power. The author seems to be unaware of the often exposed fallacies in Marx' theories and his reasoning powers are revealed when we read on page 25 "Jesus taught . . . that it was the mission of himself and disciples to establish a new heaven, that is, to remodel the church; and a new earth, that is, to remodel the state; both remodelings being with reference to the service of humanity by enlightening its darkness and *alleviating its misery here and now*, rather than teaching it to look for light and happiness elsewhere and elsewhere," and on page 33 "Whereas the gospel of Marx is exclusively concerned with this terrestrial world, about which I know much and for which I can do a little, the gospel of Jesus is as *exclusively concerned with a celestial world*, about which I know nothing and for which I cannot do the least," and when we reach page 194, the Bishop has been convinced by Professor W. B. Smith that "the Jesus of the New Testament never was a real man."

The fact that the author is a Bishop is probably the reason for the very large sale of this work; the Episcopate has been made a donkey engine to Marxian Socialism, that is, to class hatred and the policies of Antichrist. It is altogether suitable that an apostate Bishop should become the echo of an apostate Jew.

A. HAIRE FORSTER

The Returning Tide of Faith. By Neville S. Talbot, Bishop of Pretoria. New York: Revell, 1923, pp. 222. \$1.50 net.

The substance of this book is a series of articles which appeared in the Johannesburg Rand Daily Mail. Theological articles by a Bishop in a daily newspaper: this is surely "a step in the right direction" especially when the Bishop is also a theologian.

In his preface the author writes "Odd as it will seem to many, it is clear that the Christian Church, if she knows her business, will have again to be the guardian and champion of rationality

in faith in the face of irrationalism in religion. I wonder whether she does know her business? Is she ready boldly to present the Faith to those who, under modern conditions, are willing to think about it? Certainly the Church of the Province of South Africa, to which I belong, is not nearly so well developed as a teaching Church as she is as the organizer of institutional religion. She is well developed on the side of the ministry of the Sacraments. She needs reinforcement in the ministry of the Word. The whole Church needs to think out her message fearlessly."

If crude and antiquated presentations of the Christian Faith are the main cause of modern indifference and unbelief, then this book should do much to promote a return to reasonable religion.

Some of the chapter headings will indicate the scope of the articles—The Good News, Omnipotence, The Atonement, The Church: is it necessary?, Hell, life After Death.

A. HAIRE FORSTER

The Training of Children in the Christian Family. By Luther Allan Weigle. Boston: Pilgrim Press, 1922, pp. ix + 224. \$1.50.

This is just the book that many Christian parents are looking for—a brief, clear, readable treatise on the religious nurture of the child at home. It of course represents the best modern psychology and pedagogy, and will be of especial value to parents whose children are receiving a modern religious education in Church School or week-day classes. Such parents will not only understand better what the pupil is receiving at school, but will be enabled to cooperate in the most satisfactory way. The clergy will find it a very useful, stimulating book, and one to recommend to parents and teachers.

FREDERICK C. GRANT

Das Wesen des Judentums. Von Leo Baeck. Frankfurt a. M.: J. Kauffmann, 1923, pp. x, 327.

This is the third edition of a work first issued in 1906, now put forth with many additions to the original matter. The author's

thesis makes Judaism singularly modern, "*Wofern man dieses Wort nicht allzu weit faszt, kann sogar gesagt werden, dass das Judentum überhaupt keine Dogmen hat und infolgedessen ja auch eigentlich nicht eine Orthodoxie*" (p. 4). Modern also is the strong emphasis laid upon the ethical side, both personal and social. But, while his dogma remains simple, there is more than one might judge from the above statement; eighty pages are given to defining the belief about God, and other dogmatic conceptions appear throughout the work. Perhaps the greatest fault of the book is to be found in the slight regard for the development of the religion, also in an underrating of the power of attainment which the New Testament gives; but it is a readable book and, chiefly on account of its ethical interest, deserving of a place beside Weber, Kohler, Schechter, etc.

F. H. HALLOCK

Les Travaux Archéologiques en Syrie de 1920 à 1922. Par Ch. Clermont-Ganneau, Fr. Cumont, R. Dussaud, Ed. Naville, Ed. Pottier et Ch. Vrohlé. Avec une Préface de M. le Général Gouraud. Paris: M. Paul Geuthner, 1923, pp. vi, 77.

This is the first published report of the new work undertaken under the patronage of the Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres on Oriental soil. At Byblos were found vases, jewels, arms, etc., of Egyptian origin, showing that Egyptians of the earlier dynasties, up to the Twelfth, had journeyed thither; as well as objects of indigenous and Asiatic origin. Of more general interest is a series of frescoes, reproduced in excellent colored plates. These were first seen by Dr. Breasted. They belong to the Roman period, depict Syrian priests offering sacrifice, and were found at Sâlihiyeh on the Euphrates, near the spot where Gordian III was assassinated in 244 A.D. M. Franz Cumont studies these frescoes at length, and suggests that the place in which they were found was a chapel erected in memory of the Emperor. The Académie has met with marked success in its first undertaking under the French Protectorate and will, we trust, be inspired by it to further research.

F. H. HALLOCK

Classics of the Soul's Quest. By R. E. Welsh. New York: Doran, 1923, pp. 342. \$2.00 net.

Such "classics" as those with which Dr. Welsh here deals supply the best kind of material for the study of the psychology of religion, and are of the highest utility for apologetics in a pragmatic age. The author treats of religious experience in general, not of the narrower fields of conversion or repentance, though these are necessarily included incidentally. Dr. Welsh has read widely and knows how to use his reading aptly. Very suggestive is the way in which he associates the men of whom he writes with the events of their age, *e.g.*, the mingling of pagan and Christian heritage in S. Augustine and the fusion of the same elements in his age, Christianity ultimately triumphing in each. Excellent character studies, often expressed in a sentence or two, are numerous. In the case of S. Augustine he has to travel a well-beaten path, but even one who has read much of the vast literature concerned with the Bishop of Hippo and his *Confessions* will here find a certain freshness of treatment and of arrangement of material. No two persons would agree upon the matter to be included; we would doubt if he has justified the inclusion of Dante, and chaps. XIV and XV make us wonder whether it would not be better to record more fully the Christian classics before wandering into the field of other religions. We welcome chap. XIII on Pater's *Marius the Epicurean* as well worth study in an age when an increasing number of people are finding their religion in a combination of æsthetics and morality, a fusion of Epicurean and Stoic elements.

F. H. HALLOCK

Monuments of the Early Church. By Walter Lowrie. New York: Macmillan, 1923, pp. xxii, 432. \$2.50.

This is a work which needs no introduction. The necessity for the issuing of the present reprint of the 1901 edition is the best evidence of its abiding value; in the twenty-two years which have elapsed nothing has been published to take its place. We have enjoyed afresh turning the pages and looking at the many

and excellent illustrations, chiefly of the catacombs and early basilicas.

F. H. HALLOCK

Das Wesen der Religion. Von Georg Wobbermin. Zweites Buch. Leipzig: J. C. Hinrichs'sche Buchhandlung, 1922, pp. 315-500.

In reviewing (ATR, Dec., 1922, pp. 243f.) the "First Book" of the II volume of Wobbermin's *Systematische Theologie nach religionspsychologischer Methode* (Vol. I, 1913), I said that it ought to be translated. The "Second Book," now before us, serves to confirm the suggestion. For, whatever may be urged *pro* or *con* Wobbermin's views, they are important because so characteristically—one had almost said purely—German; and we ought to know what Germans are thinking at the present juncture. Nay, more, they presuppose the whole history of movements within German Protestantism.

Book I dealt with "The Question of the Nature, apart from the Truth, of Religion." The present section, containing pp. 315-500 of Volume II, discusses "The Question of the Truth of Religion in the Light of its Nature." There are six chapters (VIII-XIII of the whole): VIII, The Proofs for the Determinate Being of God; IX, Religion, Magic and Mythology; X, The Conflict between Knowledge and Belief in the Interpretation of Human Experience (*Weltanschauung*); X, Illusionism and the Problem of Truth; XII, The Religious Interpretation of Human Experience and Modern Natural Science; XIII, The Primacy of Religion in the Life of the Spirit. Convenient subject- and name-indices for the complete volume are appended.

The agents formative of Wobbermin's outlook are Kant, Schleiermacher, the reaction against metaphysical treatment of theology in the Ritschlian School and, supervening upon the last, influences from some of the half-philosophies cast up by the transitional age in German thought since 1885. Thus, following Kant, the traditional "Proofs of the Existence of God" are abandoned. Yet, man cannot forego a *Weltanschauung*. Ac-

cordingly, examination of competitive interpretations of human experience may elicit common tendencies converging upon a substitute for the "Proofs." On the whole, Wobbermin is conscious that the "scientific view of the universe" has ceased to be the main adversary of religion (or theology). Nevertheless, in Chapter X he pays his compliments to Haeckel's shallow Monism (which, as we should remember, attained great vogue in Germany), and dismisses Bergson with short shrift—properly, as I think. On the other hand, he is aware that the dangerous enemies of religion today are anthropologism and psychologism. He grapples with these in Chapters IX and XI, which are the most important and valuable in the book. The former is concerned with *Urmonotheismus* as set forth by Deussen, and with kindred notions attributable to Durkheim, Frazer, and Leuba. In Chapter XI "Illusionism" is traced back to L. Feuerbach; follows a masterly exposure of the psychologism of Freud and Co., of the anthropologism of Marx, Engels, and Gruppe; and a review of various subjective aberrations—Leuba, Natorp, Simmel, for example. Chapters XII and XIII recall the positions already reached by Wobbermin some twenty-five years ago (1900), in *Christian Belief in God*; the admirable translation of the third edition by D. S. Robinson (Yale University Press, 1918) ought certainly to be read as an aid to grasping the principles latent in the larger work.

Wobbermin remains a living witness to the extraordinary impression made upon theologians by Schleiermacher; and we must recollect that no parallel impression was made upon philosophers. He seems to intimate that the Absolute is not an object of knowledge, and therefore to abandon a genetic or objective construction. That is to say, his philosophy is not his strong point. On the contrary, he maintains that God is to be reached, if at all, by a "heartfelt longing" and, as heartfelt longings pertain necessarily to individuals, Protestant subjectivity betrays itself. It would be unfair to say that he regards the Church as "a voluntary club." But there are too many traces of ethicism and,

equally, too much obliviousness of the fact that *our* religion came to be what it is thanks to the speculative Universalistic idealism of the great Greeks. Nevertheless, with every deduction, Wobbermin has his own quiet power. He would agree with Washburn Hopkins' recent definition, the end of a very different road round: "Religion . . . is the experience in which the soul . . . becomes conscious of itself as one with the divine soul. It is an experience which can convince only him who experiences it, but to him the proof is irrefragable and not to be gainsaid." But he explores the implications as a theologian, and so ably that we must rank him with F. von Hügel, and Troeltsch whose recent death has left us much poorer. All must eagerly await the promised volume which is to complete the "System."

R. M. WENLEY

A Dictionary of Religion and Ethics. Edited by Shailer Mathews and Gerald Birney Smith. New York: Macmillan, 1923, pp. 513. \$3.00.

This dictionary was first published in 1921 at \$8.00. It now appears in reprinted form for \$3.00. It is well worth its original price, and the publishers are to be congratulated upon the splendid offer, which places the book within the reach of the most modest salary. And it is a splendid guide. There are few religious problems upon which it has not something enlightening to say. It is by all odds the best dictionary on religious matters to recommend to the average minister and Sunday School teacher. Of course, it does not pretend to take the place of Hastings' *Encyclopædia of Religion and Ethics*, but it does set forth in compact form the results of modern study in the psychology of religion, the history of religion, the present status of religious life, and the important phases of Christian belief and practice.

There are, of course, here and there certain inaccuracies. These are due mainly to the fact that the best experts in some fields were not always secured. This is particularly true from the standpoint of Anglican usage and theology, for example, any intelligent member of the Anglican Communion will find the following subjects treated either inaccurately or insufficiently:

"Acolyte," "Agnus Dei," "Amice," "Archbishop," "Church Order," "Host," "Lamb," "Oblate," "Pulpit," "Sign of the Cross," "Tunic," "Wafer," etc. There are other subjects upon which misleading statements are made, for example, there are no *Eskimos* in Northern Newfoundland, nothing is said about an important phase of controversy in the *Mormon* Church, the Episcopal Church in the U. S. A. is not committed to the Thirty-nine Articles, etc. There are, however, many most excellent articles.

SAMUEL A. B. MERCER

BOOKS RECEIVED

NEW TESTAMENT

- New Testament Teaching in the Light of St. Paul's.* By A. H. McNeile. N. Y.: Macmillan, 1923, pp. xix, 320. \$2.75.
- The Minister and His Greek New Testament.* By A. T. Robinson. N. Y.: Doran, 1923, pp. 139.
- Introduction au Nouveau Testament.* Tome I. Les Evangiles Synoptiques. By M. Goguel. Paris: Leroux, 1923, pp. 532. Frcs. 20.
- Problems of the New Testament To-day.* By R. H. Malden. N. Y.: Oxford Univ. Press, 1923, pp. 250. \$2.20.
- Neutestamentliche Apokryphen.* Von Edgar Hennecke. Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr, 1923, pp. 128.
- New Testament Greek for Beginners.* By J. G. Machen. N. Y.: Macmillan, 1923, pp. xii, 285. \$2.20.

HISTORY AND PATRISTICS

- Der hl. Dominikus. Untersuchungen und Texte.* Von B. Altaner. Breslau: G. P. Aderholz, 1923, pp. xviii, 265.
- Des hl. Basilius d. Gr. Geistliche Übungen.* Von Jos. Wittig. Breslau: G. P. Aderholz, 1922, pp. viii, 89.
- Documents Illustrative of the History of the Church.* Vol. II. 313-461 A.D. Edited by B. J. Kidd. N. Y.: Macmillan, 1923, pp. xiv, 346. \$2.60.
- The Christian Church in the Epistles of St. Jerome.* By L. Hughes. N. Y.: Macmillan, 1923, pp. viii, 116.
- Neue Studien zu Marcion.* Von Adolf von Harnack. Leipzig: Hinrichs, 1923, pp. 36.
- Écrits des Curés de Paris contre La Politique et La Morale des Jésuites (1658-1659). Avec une étude sur La Querelle du Laxisme.* Par I. De Récalde. Paris: "Editions et Librairie," 1921, pp. 403.
- Abbé de Margon. Lettres sur le Confessorat du P. Le Tellier. Avec une Introduction et des Notes sur La Politique des Jésuites et l'Oratoire.* Par I. De Récalde. Paris: "Librairie Moderne," 1922, pp. 309.
- Clément XIV. Le Bref "Dominus ac Redemptor" portant suppression de la Compagnie de Jésus.* Par I. De Récalde. Paris: "Librairie Moderne," 1920, pp. 133.
- The Monastic Chronicler and the Early School of St. Albans.* By Claude Jenkins. London: S. P. C. K. (N. Y.: Macmillan), 1922, pp. 98.
- Thomas de Cobham, Bishop of Worcester, 1317-1327.* By E. H. Pearce. London: S. P. C. K. (N. Y.: Macmillan), 1923, pp. xi, 274. \$6.00.

MISCELLANEOUS

- Poems of a Salvationist.* By E. Irena Arnold. N. Y.: Revell, 1923, pp. 160. \$1.25.
- A Dictionary of the Eastern Orthodox Church.* By R. Ll. Langford-James. London: Faith Press, n. d., pp. xiv, 144. \$3.50.

- Business Methods for the Clergy.* By M. M. Day. Milwaukee: Morehouse, 1923, pp. xiii, 46. \$75.
- Die Wiedergabe Biblischer Ereignisse in den Gesichten der Anna Katharina Emmerich.* By L. Richen. Freiburg im Bresgau: Herder, 1923, pp. viii, 75.
- Die "Schwachen" in Korinth und Rom.* By Max Rauer. Freiburg im Bresgau: Herder, 1923, pp. xvi, 192.
- Between Scarlet Thrones.* By F. W. Pickard. Boston: Stratford, 1919, pp. 223. \$2.00.
- The Book of the Lover and the Beloved. Trans. from the Catalan of Ramon Lull.* By E. A. Peers. N. Y.: Macmillan, 1923, pp. viii, 115. \$1.25.
- Modernism and the Person of Christ.* By W. J. Sparrow Simpson. Milwaukee, 1923, pp. 104. \$2.00.
- Roman Home Life and Religion. A Reader.* By H. L. Rogers and T. R. Harley. Oxford: Univ. Press, 1923, pp. xiii, 243. \$2.00.
- Moral Values and the Idea of God.* By W. R. Sorley. N. Y.: Macmillan (second edit.), 1921, pp. xix, 527. \$7.50.
- The Legacy of Rome.* Edited by Cyril Bailey. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1923, pp. xii, 512.
- Hymns from the Rigveda. Selected and Metrically Trans. by A. A. MacDonell.* N. Y.: Oxford Univ. Press, Amer. Branch, n. d., pp. 98. \$85.
- The Problem of Armaments.* By A. G. Enock. N. Y.: Macmillan, 1923, pp. xii, 196. \$1.50.
- The Coptic Manuscripts in the Freer Collection.* Univ. of Mich. Studies, Humanistic Ser., Vol. X. N. Y.: Macmillan, 1923, pp. xxvi, 396. \$4.75.
- Tutankhamen and Egyptology.* By Samuel A. B. Mercer. Milwaukee: Morehouse, 1923, pp. xi, 100. \$1.50.
- A Modern Job.* By Etienne Giran. Trans. Fred. Rothwell. Chicago: Open Court Pub. Co., 1916, pp. 92.
- Indian Philosophy, vol. I.* By S. Radhakrishnan. N. Y.: Macmillan, 1923, pp. 684.
- The Life of the Ancient East.* By Jas. Baikie. N. Y.: Macmillan, 1923, pp. xiv, 463. \$4.00.
- A Manual of English Church Music.* By G. Gardner and S. H. Nicholson. N. Y.: Macmillan, 1923, pp. 232. \$4.00.
- The American Jewish Year Book 5684.* Ed. by G. H. Schneiderman. Phila.: Jewish Pub. Soc. of Amer., 1923, pp. 593.
- A Dictionary of Religion and Ethics.* By Shailer Mathews and G. B. Smith. N. Y.: Macmillan, 1923, pp. 513. \$3.00.
- Memories of the Russian Court.* By Anna Virubova. N. Y.: Macmillan, 1923, pp. 399.
- The Story of the Bible.* By Hendrik Van Loon. N. Y.: Boni and Liveright, 1923, pp. 452. \$5.00.
- Icelandic Meditations on the Passion.* By C. V. Pilcher. N. Y.: Longmans, 1923, pp. 64.



Anglican Theological Review

THIS quarterly is devoted to a discussion of all theological problems from an Anglican point of view. Five features are emphasized: Long scientific articles; full classified bibliographies; scholarly book-reviews; short critical notes; and general notes and comments. The work will endeavor to be sound, scientific, and original.

All members of the Anglican Communion, and all others interested in the theological teaching of the Anglican Church, who want to keep up-to-date, should read this Review. It is edited by a board of theological specialists and is printed and published by the Columbia University Press.

TO READERS AND LIBRARIANS

Your subscription to the Review is respectfully solicited. The Review is issued in May, October, December, and March: the volume beginning with the May number. The price is four dollars annually. Single parts are one dollar each.

TO PUBLISHERS

Publishers of books and periodicals dealing with any theological subject are respectfully requested to send *books for review* and *periodicals in exchange* for the ANGLICAN THEOLOGICAL REVIEW to The Editor, Anglican Theological Review, Trinity College, Toronto, Ont., Canada.

-19

ANGLICAN THEOLOGICAL REVIEW
 Columbia University Press, *Publishers*
 Columbia University
 New York City, U. S. A.

Dear Sirs:

PLEASE enter $\left\{ \begin{array}{l} \text{my} \\ \text{our} \end{array} \right\}$ subscription to the **ANGLICAN THEOLOGICAL REVIEW** for one year beginning with the issue for _____, 19____, for which
(May, Oct., Dec. or Mar.)

I } enclose { check
we } money order } for four dollars.

Yours truly

Address _____

The Witness

Edited by Rt. Rev. Irving P. Johnson, D.D.

A Weekly Paper of the Episcopal Church
containing all of the important Church news, and articles
by the following men, who make up the
Editorial Staff:

Rev. GEORGE P. ATWATER
Rev. GORDON REESE
Rev. GILBERT P. SYMONS
WILLIAM S. KELLER, M.D.

Rev. ROBERT S. CHALMERS
Rev. GEO. CRAIG STEWART
Rev. FRANK E. WILSON
Rev. WILLIAM B. SPOFFORD

\$2.00 a year; \$1.50 for the clergy

*Over 200 Parishes Have Adopted the Bundle Order Plan
Details Sent on Request*

The Witness

6140 Cottage Grove Ave.

CHICAGO

SPECIALIZE FOR LENTEN READING

on two books as follows:

THE WAY OF PEACE

By the Rev. Dr. FREDERICK C. GRANT, Rector of Trinity Church, Chicago
Just Published

Heavy paper cover, 50 cts. Postage, 3 cts.

Consists of three devotional addresses to women on the subjects: The Heart of the Gospel; The Personal Practice of the Christian Life; The Social Goals of the Christian Religion. They were given to the Woman's Auxiliary of the Diocese of Chicago in St. Mark's Church, in September, 1923. There is also a suggested outline for a Quiet Day. Churchwomen everywhere will welcome this little book. The reverend clergy will find it a model for similar addresses.

MEDITATIONS ON THE CREED

By BISHOP HALL

A new edition of this classic, bound in heavy paper, issued at this time to stimulate the *devotional* use of the Creed, which so many are treating as though it were a series of hard polemic dogmas. People ought to be made familiar with this use of the Creed. It would promote its better understanding, soften prejudices, and illuminate the mind.

Price, 25 cts. Postage, 4 cts.

PUBLISHED BY

MOREHOUSE PUBLISHING CO.

1801-1811 Fond du Lac Avenue

MILWAUKEE, WIS.

